

**THE MINIMUM WAGE FOR WOMEN AND MINORS.**



by

**Walter Blaine Bodenhafer.**

**A thesis submitted to the Department of Economics  
and the Faculty of the Graduate School  
in partial fulfillment of the  
requirements for the  
Master's degree.**

*Approved by H. A. Miller*

*for the* Department of Economics.

**June 1, 1915.**

PREFACE.

The agitation for the regulation of the wages of women and minors in this country is of recent origin. The movement has, however, spread rapidly. Already eleven states have enacted laws providing for such regulation. Other states have created investigating commissions to secure data upon which to base laws. Bills providing for minimum wage laws are now being considered by the legislatures of various states.<sup>1</sup>

These facts suggest several questions. Do conditions among wage-earning women call for such interference on the part of the state? Is there an important problem of low earnings? If so, what are the causes? To what extent are youth, inefficiency, inexperience, and exploitation responsible for low wages of women and girls? What is the character of the legislation that has been tried, and what have been the results? An attempt is made in this essay to answer these and other questions.

The first chapter is devoted to a consideration of the problem of low earnings and the causes; the second, to an examination of the laws adopted in the various states; the third, to the orders issued by some of the wage commissions; and the fourth, to the conclusions toward which the facts given in the preceding chapters lead.

---

1. April 1, 1915.



## TABLE OF CONTENTS

## CHAPTER I. THE PROBLEM OF LOW EARNINGS

Introduction - - - - -	1
Results of state and private investigations - - -	2
Results of federal investigations - - - - -	34
Causes of low earnings - - - - -	55

## CHAPTER II. AN ANALYSIS OF MINIMUM WAGE LAWS

Types of laws found - - - - -	79
Tabulation of the laws - - - - -	80
The commissions - - - - -	96
The advisory boards - - - - -	100
Enforcement and penalties - - - - -	107

## CHAPTER III. ORDERS ISSUED BY SOME OF THE COMMISSIONS

Introduction - - - - -	110
Oregon - - - - -	111
Washington - - - - -	115
Minnesota - - - - -	121
Massachusetts - - - - -	123
Utah - - - - -	127

## CHAPTER IV. CONCLUSIONS

Introduction - - - - -	130
Effects of the laws - - - - -	131
Problems of administration - - - - -	136
Conclusion - - - - -	139

BIBLIOGRAPHY - - - - -	140
------------------------	-----

## CHAPTER I.

## THE PROBLEM OF LOW EARNINGS.

Is there a problem of low earnings among the wage-earning women of the country? If so, how extensive is it? Is it confined to a few localities, or to a small number of industries? What are the causes of low wages? In this chapter an effort is made to answer these and other questions. The fact of low earnings is generally conceded. The causes are matters on which differences of opinion exist. The most important causes advanced to explain the existence of low earnings are, youth, inexperience, inefficiency, and exploitation.

Wage conditions of women and girls have been extensively investigated by private commissions, state commissions, and by the federal government; the investigation by the last named being the most extensive. A consideration of the problem of low earnings necessarily involves much statistical data. The material used is arranged to show, first, the earnings of a large number of women and girls employed in various industries in different parts of the country; secondly, the causes of low wages. It seems best, however, to discuss the matter of youth as one of the causes of low wages, in connection with the general tables, in order that the relation of youth to earnings may be more clearly seen and that, in so far as possible, that factor may be eliminated from the wage figures given.

The Massachusetts Minimum Wage Commission, created by the law of 1912, began its investigations July 1, 1913. Reports have been issued covering the brush industry, corset and confectionery factories, and laundries. These four were selected because of the large proportion of women workers employed in them and because there was reason to believe that wages were low in those industries. The results, which are given in the tables below, seem to indicate that such belief was well founded. To secure the data a transcript of the pay rolls for the fifty-two weeks preceding the time of the investigation was taken. This was supplemented by schedules filled out by individuals and by private investigations by agents of the commission.

All of the thirty-two brush factories in the state were included in the investigation. The results for that industry are given in Tables I, II, and III following.

Table. I.

Average Weekly Earnings of 597 Female Workers in Brush Industry in Massachusetts.<sup>1</sup>

	Under \$4	Under \$5	Under \$6	Under \$7	Under \$8	Under \$9	Over \$9
Number	105	255	395	422	529	555	42
Per Cent	17.6	42.7	66.2	79.0	88.6	93.0	7.0

Table. II.

Home Conditions and Weekly Earnings of 481 Workers; Brush Industry<sup>2</sup>

	Under \$4	Under \$5	Under \$6	Under \$7	Under \$8	Under \$9	Over \$9
At Home	16.5	44.9	68.3	81.0	89.4	93.5	6.5
Adrift	17.5	31.8	63.5	76.2	88.9	92.0	7.9

Table. III.

Average Weekly Earnings of 482 Workers in the Brush Industry Classified by Age and Per Cent Earning Specified Amounts.<sup>3</sup>

Age					Under \$4	Under \$5	Under \$6	Under \$7	Under \$8	Under \$9	\$9 and over
14	but	less	than	16	63.5	88.9	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	--
16	but	less	than	18	36.3	87.3	92.7	96.4	98.1	98.1	1.9
18	"	"	"	21	15.0	55.7	81.4	88.5	93.8	97.3	2.7
21	"	"	"	25	7.6	23.8	57.1	78.1	87.6	91.4	8.6
25	"	"	"	30	5.3	24.0	49.3	64.0	80.0	88.0	12.0
30	"	"	"	35	8.1	29.7	56.7	72.9	86.5	89.2	10.8
35	"	"	"	40	14.3	25.0	50.0	75.0	89.3	92.8	7.2
40	"	"	"	45	-	16.7	58.3	83.3	91.6	91.6	8.4
45	"	"	"	50	-	16.7	50.0	58.3	91.6	91.6	8.4
50	"	"	"	55	16.7	16.7	50.0	83.3	83.3	83.3	16.7
55	"	"	"	60	-	-	-	-	-	66.7	33.3

1. 1st. Annual Rept., Mass. Minimum Wage Commission, 1914, p. 30.

2. Ibid., p. 31.

3. Ibid., p. 36.

Table I shows the wages of 597 women and girls of all ages out of a total of 837 found on the pay rolls of the factories at the time of the investigation. From this table it is seen that 88.6 per cent were receiving less than \$8 per week, the amount necessary for decent living, as estimated by the wage board in the brush industry. In view of the fact that low earnings among female employees are often attributed to the youth of the employees, it is interesting to compare the results given in Table III with the first mentioned table. Thus it is seen that 80.0 per cent of the age group receiving the highest remuneration received less than \$8. Of these whose ages ranged from 30 to 35 years, 86.5 per cent received less than \$8. Thus it is apparent that a very vital problem of low earnings remains after all allowance for youth is made. The averages for the groups above the age of forty years are open to question because of the small numbers in those groups. This is especially true of the last two groups.

Table II gives the earnings of 481 workers classified according to home conditions. Of the 481 workers, 13.2 per cent were a-drift, and 86.8 per cent were classed as at home. In both classes a large per cent were earning less than \$8 per week.

The corset industry in Massachusetts is confined to three localities, Worcester, Springfield, and West Brookfield. The eight factories located in these three cities employed 2,388 women at the time of the investigation, and wage records were secured for all of them. The following were excluded from the tables: those workers employed for less than four weeks in the year, those working in paper box factories connected with the corset factories, and those for whom the factory records were incomplete or defective. This reduces the number tabulated in Table IV to 2, 110. The wages paid in the corset industry are shown in Tables IV, V, and VI, which follow.

Table. IV.

Average Weekly Earnings of 2,110 Female Workers in the Corset Industry in Massachusetts<sup>1</sup>

	Under \$4	Under \$5	Under \$6	Under \$7	Under \$8	Under \$9	Over \$9
Number	204	423	749	1128	1450	1764	346
Per Cent	9.6	20.0	35.5	53.5	68.7	83.6	16.4

Table. V.

Home Conditions and Weekly Earnings of 672 Workers in the Corset Industry<sup>2</sup>

	Under \$4	Under \$5	Under \$6	Under \$7	Under \$8	Under \$9	Over \$9
At Home	11.8	24.9	41.2	60.3	77.8	90.5	9.3
Adrift	6.5	15.8	33.3	54.8	70.7	83.0	16.8

Table. VI.

Average Weekly Earnings of 667 Workers in the Corset Industry Classified by Age and Per Cent Earning Specified Amounts<sup>3</sup>

Age	Under \$4	Under \$5	Under \$6	Under \$7	Under \$8	Under \$9	\$9 and over
14 out less than 16	50.0	74.2	84.7	97.2	100.0	100.0	-
16 " " "	21.3	46.0	64.0	84.3	93.2	97.7	2.3
18 " " "	2.9	14.7	38.2	65.8	82.9	95.9	4.1
21 " " "	1.3	10.7	20.8	38.8	69.1	84.5	15.5
23 " " "	-	5.2	18.2	37.7	55.8	79.2	20.8
25 " " "	7.1	10.7	14.4	35.7	50.0	64.3	35.7
30 " " "	7.4	25.9	44.4	48.3	70.4	81.5	18.5
35 " " "	15.4	19.2	30.8	50.0	69.2	84.5	15.5
40 " " "	9.1	18.2	27.3	63.6	81.8	81.8	18.2
45 " " "	-	22.2	55.5	77.8	88.9	88.9	11.1
50 " " "	-	-	25.0	50.0	50.0	100.0	-
55 " " "	20.0	20.0	20.0	20.0	40.0	40.0	60.0
60 and over							

- 1. First Annual Rept., Mass. Minimum Wage Commission, 1914, p. 53.
- 2. Ibid., p. 59.
- 3. Ibid., p. 54.



In the corset factories a higher level of wages is found than in the brush factories. According to Table IV, 68.7 per cent of the 2,110 women reporting were receiving less than \$8 per week. Table VI gives the earnings of a smaller number of workers, 667, classified in detail according to age. Here it is seen that exactly one-half of the age group receiving the highest wages, earned less than a living wage as estimated by the wage board in the brush industry. The small number included after the age of 45 is reached makes the averages for those groups somewhat unreliable. On the whole, the table shows a large percentage of the employees receiving less than a living wage in all the different age groups. Here again the fact of youth does not explain low earnings.

Table V shows the earnings of 672 workers classified as at home and adrift. Of this number, 107, or 15.9 per cent, were found to be living adrift, and 70 per cent of them were receiving less than the amount necessary to support them decently. A glance at the table shows those adrift earning higher wages than those at home, but the difference is not great.

The investigation of the laundries by the Massachusetts Commission was confined to power laundries used by the public, and did not include Chinese laundries nor those used by the public institutions. It included thirty-six establishments, widely scattered and embracing the principal cities of the state. Employees not appearing on the pay rolls for more than four weeks during the preceding year were not included in the tables. Tables VII, VIII, and IX, which follow, give the results of the investigation with regard to wages, home conditions, and age.



Table. VII.

Average Weekly Earnings of 2,961 Women Workers in Laundries  
in Massachusetts<sup>1</sup>

	Under \$4	Under \$5	Under \$6	Under \$7	Under \$8	Under \$9	Over \$9
Number	242	740	1535	2048	2441	2720	243
Per Cent	8.2	25.0	51.5	68.8	82.2	91.8	8.2

Table. VIII.

Weekly Earnings in Relation to Home Conditions<sup>2</sup>; 1,218 Workers

	Under \$4	Under \$5	Under \$6	Under \$7	Under \$8	Under \$9	Over \$9
At Home	2.9	13.8	37.9	57.9	75.3	87.9	12.1
Adrift	3.2	14.6	33.1	54.9	73.1	84.2	15.8

Table. IX.

Average Weekly Earnings of 1215 Workers in Laundries  
Classified by Age and Per Cent Earning Specified Amounts<sup>3</sup>

Age	Under \$4	Under \$5	Under \$6	Under \$7	Under \$8	Under \$9	\$9 and over
14 but less than 16	17.8	71.4	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	-
16 " " " 18	4.6	31.5	67.6	90.7	98.1	100.0	-
18 " " " 21	2.1	11.5	38.7	67.0	86.9	95.8	4.2
21 " " " 25	2.3	10.5	26.4	62.6	81.3	93.4	6.6
25 " " " 30	1.6	5.5	25.6	42.1	61.7	78.0	22.0
30 " " " 35	3.1	12.2	29.6	40.8	59.1	71.4	28.6
35 " " " 40	.9	9.2	20.2	44.5	63.0	78.9	21.1
40 " " " 45	5.3	14.7	28.0	44.0	66.6	78.7	21.3
45 " " " 50	2.0	14.0	30.0	44.0	54.0	74.0	26.0
50 " " " 55	5.7	22.6	37.1	60.0	77.1	91.4	8.6
55 " " " 60	-	14.3	35.7	50.0	71.4	92.8	7.2
60 and over	22.0	33.2	33.3	66.7	77.8	88.9	11.1

1. Bulletin No. 5, Mass. Minimum Wage Commission, October 1914, p. 29-30.
2. Ibid., p. 39.
3. Ibid., p. 38

Taking up the tables for analysis, we find, according to Table VII, that more than one-half of the 2,961 women employed in the laundries investigated received less than \$6 per week, 68.8 per cent received less than \$7, and 82.2 per cent less than \$8. Table IX gives the earnings of 1,215 workers grouped according to age. From this table it is apparent that while there is a relation existing between low wages and youth, a serious problem remains to be solved after the effect of youth has been allowed for. As is generally the case, a larger per cent are found living adrift in the laundry trade than in the other lines of employment.

In Table VIII the home conditions of 1,218 workers are shown. Of this number, 273, or 22.5 per cent, were living away from home and 73 per cent of these were earning less than \$8 per week. If one glances at the table one sees only a slight variation in wages at the different levels, between the two classes, which seems to lead to the conclusion that the matter of living adrift or at home does not materially affect the wages of those employed in laundries.

The investigation of the confectionery industry in Massachusetts covered fourteen establishments selected in such a manner as to include nearly all the important kinds of candy manufacturing and several of the more important establishments of the state. Among candy factories, as is shown by the tables following, are found the lowest wages of any of the four industries investigated by the commission. Table X gives the earnings of more than 3,000 workers; Table XI gives the earnings of a smaller number classified with regard to home conditions; and Table XII gives the earnings in relation to age.

Table. X.

Average Weekly Earnings of 3,326 Women Workers in Candy Factories in Massachusetts<sup>1</sup>

	Under \$4	Under \$5	Under \$6	Under \$7	Under \$8	Under \$9	Over \$9
Number	763	1629	2314	2787	3163	3243	83
Per Cent	23.1	49.0	69.6	83.8	92.1	97.5	2.5

Table. XI

Weekly Earnings in Relation to Home Conditions; 1595 Workers<sup>2</sup>

	Under \$4	Under \$5	Under \$6	Under \$7	Under \$8	Under \$9	Over \$9
At Home	5.6	28.1	54.0	73.4	84.9	95.1	4.9
Apart	3.5	24.6	57.0	86.8	94.7	98.2	1.8

Table. XII.

Average Weekly Earnings of 1602 Workers in Candy Factories Classified by Age and Per Cent Earning Specified Amounts<sup>3</sup>

	Under \$4	Under \$5	Under \$6	Under \$7	Under \$8	Under \$9	\$9 and over
14 but less than 16	33.3	84.5	97.6	99.2	100.0	100.0	--
16 " " 18	4.8	40.8	77.9	92.3	98.3	100.0	1.1
18 " " 21	1.3	17.4	48.0	74.0	88.7	96.3	3.7
21 " " 25	2.3	14.4	39.3	61.0	75.1	91.5	8.5
25 " " 30	4.2	15.9	32.6	56.2	73.6	93.0	7.0
30 " " 35	3.4	11.9	28.8	49.2	62.7	84.7	15.3
35 " " 40	-	22.9	40.0	62.9	74.3	91.4	8.6
40 " " 45	8.7	43.5	65.2	78.3	87.9	95.6	4.4
45 " " 50	5.0	50.0	85.0	90.0	95.0	100.0	-
50 " " 55	25.0	58.3	91.6	91.6	100.0	100.0	-
55 " " 60	25.0	25.0	75.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	-

1. BU. No. 4, Mass. Minimum Wage Commission, October 1914. pp.28-29.

2. Ibid., p. 37.

3. Ibid., p. 38.

Using Table X, it is seen that 92.1 per cent of the 3,326 workers included in the tabulation were receiving less than \$8 per week. Almost one-half were receiving less than \$5 per week. A large percentage of the workers were girls under 21 years of age, and to this is probably due a considerable part of the low earnings noted. Turning to Table XII, where the earnings of 1602 workers are tabulated according to age groups, the relation of age to earnings can better be determined. Of the 1,602 workers, 867, or more than one-half, were under the age of 21. The per cent of these 867 minors, who received less than \$8 per week, is very high, running from 100 in the first group to 88.3 in the third age group. Youth alone, however, does not explain the low earnings. Of those above the age of 21, three-fourths were receiving less than \$8 per week. The age group receiving the highest wages, that from 30 to 35 years, had 62.7 per cent receiving less than that sum per week.

Due, perhaps, to the youth of a majority of the employees, a large per cent of the 1,595 workers classified in Table XI were living at home, i.e. with parents or relatives. An interesting and puzzling feature of this table is that after the \$5 level has been passed, those adrift were earning lower wages than those at home.

Commission on Table XIII. the conditions of women**Cost of Living of Self-Supporting Woman in the Brush Industry<sup>1</sup>**


---

Lodging and Extras-----	\$2.00
Food-----	3.50
Clothing-----	.87
Car Fare-----	.60
Laundry-----	.20
Church-----	.10
Newspapers (Sunday and every other day)-----	.08
Vacation (one week per year at \$10)-----	.19
Picture Shows (Once in two weeks)-----	.05
Theatre (Once in two months at 25 cents)-----	.04
Other-----	.17
Total for the week-----	\$8.28

---

1. Bulletin No. 3, Mass. Minimum Wage Commission, August 15, 1914, p. 19. This budget was contained in the report of the Brush Makers' Wage Board submitted March 17, 1914. Concerning this budget the Board said, "The lowest total for human conditions for an individual in Boston is thus seen to be \$8.28. This amount is lower than that of \$8.71, tentatively arrived at by the board in its early proceedings. It makes no allowance for savings or for insurance and is not therefore a true living wage. Allowing for variations between individuals, the wage board is convinced that the sum required to keep alive and in health a completely self-supporting woman in Boston is in no case less than \$8, and in many cases may rise to \$9 or more."



A special Commission to investigate the conditions of wage-earning women and minors in the state of Connecticut was appointed in 1911. Its report was submitted in 1913. The scope of the investigation was limited to three industries employing the largest number of women, namely, - textiles, metal trades, and corset factories. however, A limited investigation, was made of the rubber industry. In all, fifty factories located in fourteen localities, were investigated. In the investigation of the cotton and silk industries wage data were copied from pay rolls for a recent and normal period. In the other industries included in the table below, the data were copied from the pay rolls for the period of one year preceding the investigation. An effort was made to select those factories which were representative. In Table XIV the results of the investigation are set forth.

The Commission did not undertake an investigation of weekly budgets of the women employed in the industries investigated. It states, however, that the investigations which had been made had shown "that \$7 is barely a living wage for a girl or woman who must pay for food, lodging, clothing, laundry, carfares, and medical or dental care out of this amount if she lives alone, or has to contribute her share of support to those who may be dependent upon her." <sup>1</sup>

---

1. Connecticut; Special Commission, Rept., Conditions of Wage-Earning Women. p. 16.

Table. XIV.

Per Cent of Female Employees Receiving Less than Specified  
Amounts, Average Weekly Earnings; Classified According to  
Age and Industry; Connecticut.

	Under \$4	Under \$5	Under \$6	Under \$7	Under \$8	Under \$9	Under \$10	Under \$11	Over \$11
<b>Cotton<sup>1</sup></b>	1231 Workers investigated								
Under 16	16.53	40.82	55.10	87.76	93.68	95.92	97.95	100.0	-
16 and over	1.15	4.09	14.41	27.57	43.36	57.89	74.00	88.2	11.8
	1.90	5.90	16.41	30.53	45.85	59.76	75.18	88.7	11.3
<b>Silk<sup>2</sup></b>	1175 Workers investigated								
Under 16	55.56	55.56	77.78	77.78	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.0	-
16 and over	5.05	13.03	28.38	56.60	70.24	80.45	89.03	92.9	7.1
	5.56	13.65	29.40	58.04	72.06	80.20	88.90	92.8	7.2
<b>Coarse<sup>3</sup></b>	1739 Workers investigated								
Under 16	43.42	72.37	81.85	98.69	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.0	-
16 and over	7.08	17.03	29.21	49.15	66.11	84.21	93.01	97.1	2.9
	9.20	20.26	33.24	52.05	68.10	85.14	93.43	97.2	2.7
<b>Metal Trades<sup>4</sup></b>	2416 Workers investigated								
Under 16	22.89	56.48	81.76	90.07	96.18	99.24	100.00	100.0	-
16 and over	2.19	9.07	22.92	46.00	78.65	92.18	97.93	99.4	.6
	2.98	10.90	25.13	47.64	79.30	92.42	97.93	99.4	.6
<b>Rubber<sup>5</sup></b>	431 Workers investigated								
Under 16	75.00	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.0	-
16 and over	2.60	10.64	29.08	49.65	79.44	96.22	98.49	99.8	.2
	3.17	12.32	30.41	50.59	79.83	96.29	98.61	99.8	.2

1. Connecticut; Special Commission, Rept., Conditions of Wage-Earning Women, p. 65.

2. Ibid., p. 88.

3. Ibid., p. 115.

4. Ibid., p. 196.

5. Ibid., p. 213.

Using \$7 as a standard and studying the table just given, it is seen that 27.57 per cent of the female employees, 16 years of age and over, in the cotton industry received less than that amount. Restricting the inquiry to the same age, and passing on to the other industries given, we find 49.15 per cent of the workers in the corset industry, 46 per cent in the metal trades, 49.65 per cent in the rubber industry, and 56.60 per cent in the silk industry, receiving less than \$7 per week. "It is, therefore, evident that practically one-half of the women employed in these factories earn less than a living wage".<sup>1</sup>

Another important part of the report, in connection with the matter of low earnings, is that dealing with the per cent contributing and the amount contributed to the family fund by those who are living at home. These facts are given in the table which follows.

---

1. Connecticut; Special Commission, Rept., Conditions of Wage-Earning Women. p. 16.



Table XV.

Per Cent of Women Workers in All Industries, Who Reported Contribution of All, Part, or None of their Weekly Earnings to the Family Income.<sup>1</sup> 2,001 Workers.

Age	Contributing to Family		
	All	Part	None
14 to 15 years	95.60	4.30	1.15
16 " 17 "	85.54	12.31	2.15
18 " 20 "	67.76	31.31	.93
21 " 24 "	58.51	40.23	1.16
25 " 34 "	59.22	39.94	.84
35 " 44 "	74.66	24.66	.68
45 " 54 "	80.59	19.41	1.00
55 and over	70.59	23.53	5.88
	69.62	29.29	1.09

1. Connecticut; Special Commission, Rept., Conditions of Wage-Earning Women, p. 254. 1913.

Table XV, covering 2,001 female employees in the five industries mentioned, is significant in view of the prevalent idea that the wages of most women and girls are "pin money". It shows that 69.62 per cent of the whole number turn over all, while 29.29 per cent turn over a part of their earnings to the family fund. Excluding those under 21 years of age, 62.7 per cent turn over all their earnings to the family with which they live. This means that, so far as these 62.7 per cent are concerned, the fact that they live at home is immaterial.

Under a law approved May 5, 1913, every mercantile establishment in the state of Ohio, employing five or more female employees, was required to report to the state Industrial Commission, among other things, the wages and hours of its female employees. From these reports the Commission secured information as to the wages of more than 15,000 women workers employed in more than one thousand establishments in the state. The wages given in the tables below do not include commissions or bonuses, and were taken for a representative week and not for an entire year. From Tables XVI and XVII the rate of wages existing in mercantile stores generally, and in the different cities of importance, can be determined.

Table XVI

Earnings of Women and Girls in Mercantile Establishments in Ohio:  
Classified According to Age, and Number and Per Cent Earning  
Specified Amounts in Representative Week<sup>1</sup>

	18 years and over		Under 18 years		Total for All Ages	
	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%
Under \$2	75	.5	77	6.9	152	1.0
\$2 but under \$3	75	.5	132	11.9	207	1.3
\$3 " " \$4	367	2.5	300	27.1	667	4.3
\$4 " " \$5	988	6.8	310	27.9	1298	8.3
\$5 " " \$6	1628	11.1	165	14.9	1793	11.4
\$6 " " \$7	2247	15.4	87	7.8	2334	14.8
\$7 " " \$8	2209	15.1	21	1.9	2230	14.2
\$8 " " \$9	1746	12.0	13	1.2	1759	11.2
\$9 " " \$10	1176	8.0	-	-	1176	7.5
\$10 " " \$11	1323	9.0	4	.4	1327	8.4
\$11 " " \$12	321	2.2	-	-	321	2.0
\$12 " " \$15	1204	8.2	-	-	1204	7.6
\$15 " " \$20	858	5.8	-	-	858	5.5
\$20 and over	418	2.8	-	-	418	2.7
	14635	100.0	1109	100.0	15744	100.0

Table XVII

Number and Per Cent, 18 years of Age and Over, Receiving Less  
Than Specified Amounts, During A Representative Week<sup>2</sup>

	Under \$8		Under \$7		Under \$6	
	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%
Cincinnati	1223	48.2	873	34.4	490	19.3
Cleveland	805	35.7	472	20.9	254	11.3
Columbus	788	46.9	586	34.8	353	21.0
Dayton	468	53.2	267	30.4	128	14.6
Toledo	773	57.0	532	39.2	310	22.9
Cities, 25,000 to 100,000	1307	56.4	1013	43.9	621	26.9
Cities, 10,000 to 25,000	938	58.1	655	40.6	374	23.1
Towns under 10,000	1287	64.2	982	48.9	603	30.1

1. Ohio; Industrial Commission, Rept., No. 1, p. 9. 1914.

2. Ibid., pp. 16-17.

The Ohio Commission made no investigation leading to an estimate of the cost of living, but Table XVII indicates the number and per cent earning less than several amounts if any one is taken as a standard. The table is interesting also in regard to the variation in wages found in the five largest cities of the state. Thus, Cleveland has but 35.7 per cent of its workers, eighteen years of age and over, employed in mercantile establishments earning less than \$8 per week, as compared with Toledo with its 57 per cent. These are the extremes. The other cities range between the two. It is doubtful whether any close connection can be shown to exist between the cost of living in the different cities and the variations in the wages as shown by the table.<sup>1</sup> Generally speaking, there is no apparent connection between the size of the city and its wage scale for female employees.<sup>2</sup>

It can be seen from Table XVI that, taking all together, 55.3 per cent of the women employed received less than \$8 per week; 41.1 per cent less than \$7; and 26.3 per cent less than \$6 per week. Taking only those 18 years of age and over, 51.9 per cent received less than \$8; 36.8 per cent, less than \$7; and 21.4 per cent, less than \$6 per week. From these figures it is seen that the exclusion of those under the age of eighteen, while affecting the percentages receiving less than the different amounts, does not do away with the problem of low earnings.

---

1. Ohio; Industrial Commission, Rept., No. 1, pp. 11-12. 1913.

2. Ibid., p. 18.

In its fourth annual report the Board of Public Welfare of Kansas City, Missouri, gives the results of an investigation into the working conditions of factories, laundries, eight large department stores, and telephone offices. Data bearing on wages were secured by personal interviews with about two-fifths of the employees, by schedules filled out by others, and all this supplemented by information from employers. The data given in the following tables are representative of the wages of women employees in the industries named.

Table XVIII.

Actual Average Weekly Earnings of Women and Girls, Kansas City, Missouri; Classified according to Industry, and Number and Per Cent Earning Specified Sums

	Factory & Laundry <sup>1</sup>		Dept. Stores & Stores <sup>2</sup>		Telephones <sup>3</sup>	
	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%
Under \$3	24	.07	11	.8	-	-
3 to \$4	62	1.50	118	9.0	-	-
4 " \$5	222	5.95	244	17.8	135	11.2
5 " \$6	612	16.43	346	25.3	257	21.7
6 " \$7	933	25.05	220	16.1	112	9.7
7 " \$8	549	15.00	157	11.4	381	32.2
8 " \$9	458	12.29	48	3.5	66	5.2
9 " \$10	288	8.00	124	9.0	34	3.2
10 " \$12	276	7.41	54	4.0	148	12.5
12 and over	300	7.69	44	3.1	50	4.3
	3724	100.	1366	100.	1182	100.

Table XIX.

Estimate of the Cost of Living, Based upon Interviews with More than 3,000 workers in Kansas City, Missouri.<sup>4</sup>

Amount per Week	Items
\$1.50 - - - -	Clothing
2.00 - - - -	Room
3.00 - - - -	Board
.60 - - - -	Carfare
.40 - - - -	Laundry
1.00 - - - -	Incidentals, Sickness, Unemployment.
<u>\$8.50</u>	

1. Kansas City, Missouri; Board of Public Welfare, 4th. Annual Rept., p. 245.
2. Ibid., p. 245.
3. Ibid., p. 199.
4. Ibid., p. 243-244.

Table XIX indicates the estimated amount needed by a girl for a comfortable existence to be \$8.50 per week. The tables given do not permit of exact determination of the number receiving less than that amount since the wage per week quoted in Table XVIII is given in even dollars. Taking \$8, however, as the minimum for comfortable living, the table shows 64 per cent of the factory and laundry employees, 69 per cent of the workers in department and other stores, and 74.8 per cent of the girls in telephone offices receiving less than that sum.

The Board of Public Welfare found, moreover, that 75 per cent of the women investigated were living at home with parents or relatives.<sup>1</sup> Of those employed in mercantile establishments, 70.4 per cent were living at home or with relatives.<sup>2</sup> An investigation of 912 factory girls showed 22 per cent contributing all their wages to the family fund, 67 per cent contributing a part of their wages, and only 9 per cent contributing none to the family fund.<sup>3</sup> Commenting on this the Board states, "These figures explode any notions that many girls living at home go into shops in order to earn 'pin money'; a majority of them pay as much or more into the family as they would have to pay if they were boarding out, but there may be enough 'pin money' girls to help depress the wages of necessitous workers."<sup>4</sup> Of 2,400 store girls investigated, 10 per cent have one or more persons totally dependent on them. Of these 10 per cent, 65.8 per cent received less than \$8.50 per week. Almost one-fourth have one or more partially dependent on them and of this number 76 per cent have a wage less than \$8.50 per week.<sup>5</sup>

---

1. Kansas City, Missouri; Board of Public Welfare, 4 th. Ann. Rept., p 170

2. Ibid., p 237.

3. Ibid., p. 228.

4. Ibid., p. 227.

5. Ibid., p. 238.

Under the direction of the Kansas commissioner of labor, a special investigation was made of the hours, wages and conditions of labor under which women work. From this investigation, wage statistics are available for more than 6,000 women workers employed in various lines of work in cities of the first and second class. The information was obtained by personal interviews with both employers and employees, and by schedules sent in by individual workers and by employers. The wages given in the following tables were for a representative week. No classification by age was made, but not more than 75 of the total number given in the tables were under 16 years of age. The results of the investigation, in so far as wages are concerned, are given in the following tables.



Table XX.

Earnings of Women in Kansas, Full Time Workers, in both First And Second Class Cities

	Under \$4	\$4 but under \$5	\$5 but under \$6	\$6 but under \$7	\$7 but under \$8	\$8 but under \$9	\$9 but under \$10	\$10 but under \$12	\$12 and over	Total
1st. Class	192	417	738	994	687	465	273	339	549	4653
2 d. Class	56	134	235	270	180	145	66	136	191	1413
Total	248	551	973	1264	867	610	339	475	750	6067

Table XXI.

Earnings of Women in Industries from which 50 or more Workers Reported: Classified by Industries and Amounts Earned.<sup>2</sup>

	Under \$5	\$5 but under \$6	\$6 but under \$7	\$7 but under \$8	\$8 but under \$9	\$9 but under \$10	\$10 but under \$12	\$12 and over	Total
<b>Factories</b>									
Candy	52	30	16	14	10	2	10	5	139
Cigar	9	5	13	7	10	4	9	10	67
Garment	108	67	60	60	27	25	47	17	421
Glove and Mitten	63	15	14	11	1	6	4	1	115
P'ltry, Eggs and Butter	29	24	18	26	18	12	8	19	154
Print., Book Binding	29	19	93	47	46	21	33	29	317
Slaughtering, Packing	44	56	150	184	50	67	36	43	630
Soap	19	30	34	8	9	-	-	-	100
Miscellaneous	19	22	17	23	15	11	5	3	115
<b>Laundries</b>	78	148	242	163	64	26	30	19	770
<b>Mercantile Estab.</b>									
Dept. Stores, Dry Goods	91	147	249	196	204	108	191	366	1552
Five and Ten Cent	163	93	18	13	3	3	2	1	294
Ladies Apparel	1	1	7	3	8	7	11	40	78
<b>Telephone Exchanges</b>	51	270	271	85	97	19	25	9	827
<b>Office Help</b>									
Factories and Laundries	-	6	1	3	10	10	26	79	135
Mercantile, Telephones	1	1	5	11	5	3	16	18	60

1. Kansas; Bureau of Labor, Rept., 1913, pp. 61, 62, 64.

2. Ibid., pp. 24-60.

Table XXII.

Showing Home Conditions of 1794 Women in Kansas; Classified as At Home and Adrift, with Specified Earnings.<sup>1</sup>

	Under \$4	\$4 to \$6	\$6 to \$8	\$8 to \$10	\$10 to \$12	\$12 and over	Total
<b>At Home</b>							
Self-supporting only	11	126	131	69	47	87	471
Partly supported by family	15	131	102	42	37	49	376
Self-supporting, assisting family	22	223	245	105	86	95	778
							1625
<b>Adrift</b>							
Self-supporting only	-	28	39	25	12	47	142
Partly supported by family	-	1	2	6	2	4	15
Self-supporting, assisting family	-	3	1	6	1	1	12
							169

1. Kansas; Bureau of Labor, Rept., 1913, p. 64.

Table XX shows the number receiving specified amounts per week in cities of the first and second class. Computing the percentages, we find that 29.9 per cent of the 6,067 full time workers received less than \$6 per week; 50.0 per cent, less than \$7; 64.4 per cent, less than \$8 per week. Thus it is seen that whatever figure is taken as the standard, a considerable portion of the women workers receive less than that figure.

Table XXII is combined from tables covering various industries and occupations investigated, those which reported less than fifty women workers being excluded. According to the opinion of the investigators the figures given are representative of wage conditions in the state. Since no effort was made to arrive at an estimate of a living wage or cost of living for women wage earners, no conclusions can be drawn as to the number earning a living wage or less. By taking an arbitrary sum, say \$7, for comparison, it is possible to see variation in wages in the different industries or occupations and also the general drift of wages. For example, 70.5 per cent of the candy workers, 55.8 per cent of the garment workers, 44.5 per cent of the workers in the printing and book binding trades, 39.7 per cent in the meat packing industries, 46.1 per cent in the poultry, egg and butter packing establishments, and 80 per cent in the glove and mitten factories, earned less than \$7 per week. In the laundries 60.8 per cent, in department stores 31.4 per cent, and in telephone exchanges 71.4 per cent of the workers received less than that sum.

Of 1794 representative women investigated, as computed from Table XXII, 1625, or about 90 per cent, were living at home and 169, or ten per cent, adrift. This indicates a larger percentage at home than in most states where the matter has been investigated. A little consideration of the table shows that the weight of the fact that 90 per cent live at home is diminished to a large extent by the further fact that

778, or 47.8 per cent, of those at home are not only self-supporting but are also contributing to the support of the family. Of these 778 contributing to the family and supporting themselves, 245, or 31.5 per cent, earn less than \$6 per week. Of the 142 who live adrift and support themselves, approximately one-fifth receive less than the amount stated. Whether the worker lives at home or not she requires a certain amount of food, clothing, and shelter and other things necessary to her health. If these items of expense are not met by her wages, they must be supplied from the wages of others, so that, except in the case of the very young, the question as to whether she lives at home or adrift is of no great importance relatively, and certainly not of the importance given it by many when the matter of wages of women and girls is at issue.

The investigation of wages in the state of Washington was made by the Industrial Welfare Commission with a view to the administration of a minimum wage law applying to women and minors. Three lines of employment were covered, namely, mercantile establishments, factories, and laundries - all of which employ a large proportion of women workers. The cost of living was also investigated by the Commission. The results, in so far as they are applicable to the subject in hand, are given in the tables below.

Table XXIII.

Weekly Earnings of 5,155 Female Workers in Mercantile Establishments in Washington, Classified by Age and Per Cent Earning Sums<sup>1</sup>

	Under \$4	\$4 to \$4.95	\$5 to \$5.95	\$6 to \$6.95	\$7 to \$7.95	\$8 to \$8.95	\$9 to \$9.95	Under \$10	Over \$10
Under 18	4.0	15.8	19.8	32.7	15.4	7.8	2.3	98.0	2.0
Over 18	.5	.9	2.1	7.3	10.7	14.5	11.4	49.8	50.2
Total	4.5	16.7	21.9	40.0	26.1	22.3	13.7	147.8	52.2

Table XXIV

Weekly Earnings of 3,011 Female Employees in Factories in Washington, Classified by Age and Per Cent Earning specified Sums<sup>2</sup>

	Under \$6	\$6 to \$7.95	\$8 to \$9.95	Total under \$10	Total over \$10
Under 18	15.1	28.5	38.0	81.6	18.4
Over 18	5.1	16.7	25.0	47.7	52.3
Total	20.2	45.2	63.0	128.3	70.7

Table XXV

Weekly Earnings of 2,304 Female Employees in Laundries in Washington, Classified by Number and Per Cent receiving certain Sums.<sup>3</sup>

	Under \$5	Under \$6	Under \$7	Under \$8	Under \$9	Under \$10	\$10 or over
Number	31	120	344	904	1418	1668	636
Per Cent	1.3	5.2	14.9	39.2	61.5	72.4	27.6

1. Washington; Industrial Welfare Commission, Rept., March 1914, p. 18.  
In addition to the above the Commission investigated 168 employees in 5- and 10-cent stores of the state. Of this number 104 were 18 years of age or over. Of the total number of adults, 90 per cent received less than \$8 per week, while all of the minors received less than that sum. Of the whole number, 144 or 85.5 per cent received less than \$1.00 per day.
2. Ibid., p. 21.
3. Ibid., p. 30.

Table XXVI.

2,705 Female Workers, Classified According to Industries and At Home and Adrift, in State of Washington.<sup>1</sup>

Industry	At Home		Adrift	
	Number	Per Cent	Number	Per Cent
Factory	426	74.0	153	26.0
Laundry	204	38.2	328	61.7
Mercantile	821	65.4	439	34.7
Office	85	70.2	36	29.8
Telephone	162	83.9	31	16.1
Total	1718	62.0	987	36.5

Table XXVII.

Weekly Wages of 3,058 Workers Classified as At Home and Adrift<sup>2</sup>

	Under \$6	\$6 to \$7.95	\$8 to \$9.95	Total under \$10	Total over \$10	Totals		Per Cent of those under \$10	Per Cent of those over \$10
						No.	%		
At Home	264	551	439	1254	462	1716	56.1	67.9	38.0
	15.3	32.1	25.5	72.1	26.9				
Adrift	78	206	305	589	753	1342	43.8	31.9	61.9
	5.9	15.3	22.7	56.1	43.9				

Table XXVIII.

Actual Average Cost of Living of 27 Employees from Mercantile Stores by the Year and by the Week.<sup>3</sup>

Items	Year	Week
Room and board - - - - -	287.56	5.53
Clothing - - - - -	131.80	2.53
Laundry and Medicine - - - - -	22.92	.44
Car Fare - - - - -	20.62	.39
Newspapers - - - - -	29.17	.56
Magazines - - - - -	4.15	.08
Stationery and Postage - - - - -	3.98	.08
Association dues - - - - -	3.45	.07
Insurance - - - - -	12.79	.25
Vacation Expense - - - - -	13.81	.27
Amusements - - - - -	11.47	.22
Church - - - - -	7.05	.14
Incidentals - - - - -	9.51	.18
	568.28	10.74

1. Washington; Industrial Commission, Rept. of March 1914, p. 86.
2. Ibid., p. 87.
3. Ibid., p. 64. Weekly items are obtained by dividing yearly items by the number of weeks in a year.



Table XXVIII shows the average actual cost of living for twenty-seven workers employed in mercantile establishments and the items on which the money was spent. These twenty-seven women were visited personally by an agent of the Commission and the results, in the opinion of the Commission, represent the situation accurately.<sup>1</sup> Estimates by 138 employers placed the average cost of living at \$525.10 per year, or a little more than \$10 per week.<sup>2</sup> Upon these and other figures, the Commission based its conclusions that \$10 per week is approximately the minimum for decent living, and that a large part of the employees get less than that.<sup>3</sup>

Table XXIII gives the results of the investigation of the wages of women and girls employed in mercantile establishments. The significance of the table is apparent at a glance. It is interesting to note that while 98 per cent of the girls under 18 years of age received less than \$10 per week and 49.8 per cent of those 18 and over earned less than that amount, when all are taken together the percentage receiving less than \$10 rises only to 55.6. This indicates that when the whole number are taken into consideration, the effect of youth is not so great as is commonly believed. Excluding those under 18 years of age, practically one-half received less than the minimum required for decent living.

As shown by Table XXIV, 53.6 per cent of the 3,011 factory workers of all ages received less than \$10 per week. As in the mercantile establishments, the exclusion of those under the age of 18 years does not do away with the problem of low earnings. Excluding those under that age, we find that 47.7 per cent of those remaining received less than \$10 per week.

Using the same standard for the cost of living and passing to Table XXV, which gives the number and per cent of the laundry workers receiving specified amounts, it is seen that 1668, or 72.8 per cent of the

---

1. Washington; Industrial Welfare Commission, Rept., p. 48. 1914.

2. Ibid., p. 65

3. Ibid., p. 77.

whole number, received less than \$10 per week. The workers were not classified according to age, but since only 149 of the 2,304 were under the age of 18 years,<sup>1</sup> the exclusion of those under the age of 18 would not greatly affect the percentages given in the table.

The results of the investigation of the 2,705 employees with regard to home conditions, are set forth in Table XXVI. On the whole, the percentage adrift runs higher than in most other sections of the country. This is especially true of the laundry workers. Taking the figures as representative, the high percentage adrift in the laundry industry is significant in view of the fact shown above, that 72.8 per cent of the laundry workers received less than \$10 per week. The next table shows the wages of 3,058 workers classified as to home conditions also. According to this table, 43.9 per cent of those adrift received less than \$10 per week, while 73.1 per cent of those at home received less than that sum. A still higher percentage is shown to be adrift by this table than in the one just preceding. Of the 1843 workers earning less than \$10 per week, 67.9 per cent were classed as living at home and 31.9 per cent adrift. From whatever point of view the wages are examined there is evidence of undesirably low earnings.

The Social Survey Committee of the Consumers' League of Oregon conducted an investigation covering 7,500 women wage-earners in the city of Portland and 1,133 outside of the city. The information was obtained from pay rolls where available, from personal investigations and from actual experience in employment in several different establishments. The data were tabulated for only a part of the employees investigated in Portland. The tables following give in summary form the results of the investigation.

---

1. Washington; Industrial Welfare Commission, Rept., p.33. 1914.



Table XXIX.

Actual Weekly Wages of Women in Portland, Oregon; Classified by Industry and Number and Per Cent Earning Specified Amounts<sup>1</sup>

Occupation	Number under \$10	Number over \$10	Total	Per Cent under \$10	Per Cent over \$10
Department Stores	1211	867	2078	58.2	41.7
Factories	319	108	427	74.7	25.3
Hotels and Restaurants	105	108	213	49.2	50.8
Laundries	130	10	140	92.6	7.4
Office (Except Stenog.)	59	67	126	46.4	53.6
Stenographers	19	66	85	22.4	77.5
Printing Trades	32	25	57	56.1	43.8
Telephone Operators	26	26	52	50.0	50.0
Miscellaneous	19	20	39	48.7	51.3
<b>Totals</b>	<b>1920</b>	<b>1297</b>	<b>3217</b>	<b>59.6</b>	<b>40.4</b>

Table XXX

Actual Weekly Wages of Women outside of Portland, Oregon  
Classified According to Industry, Number, and Average Wage.<sup>2</sup>

Industry	Number	Average Weekly Wage
Canneries	88	\$8.07
Condensed Milk	6	8.76
Woolen Mills	280	8.65
Hotels and Restaurants	18	7.30
Laundries	518	9.11
Office help	45	8.19
Stenographers	16	11.54
Retail Stores	140	9.05
Telephone Exchanges	22	7.63
	<b>1133</b>	

Table XXXI

Itemised Statement of Cost of Living for Average Self-Supporting Woman Worker for One Year.<sup>3</sup>

Room and Board, \$25 per month, -----	\$300
Clothing -----	130
Laundry -----	25
Carfare -----	30
Doctor's bills -----	15
Lodge and Church dues -----	10
Education and Reading -----	10
<b>Total - - - - -</b>	<b>520</b>

1. Oregon; Consumers' League; Social Survey Comm., Rept. of 1913, p. 22.
2. Ibid., p. 23.
3. Ibid., p. 67.

Table XXIX should be considered with Table XXXI, which shows the amount necessary for decent, healthful living. Taking \$10 per week as the standard, it is seen that more than one-half of the workers earn less than that amount. Of the stenographers, who are the best paid according to the table, 22.4 per cent received less than \$10. Of the laundry workers, 92.6 per cent received less than that sum. These two occupations are the extremes; the others range somewhere between. The figures given lend support to the Committee's statement, "The wages paid to women workers in most occupations are miserably inadequate to meet the cost of living at the lowest standards consistent with the maintenance of the health and morals of the workers. Nearly three-fifths of the women employed in industries in Portland receive less than \$10 a week, which is the minimum weekly wage that ought to be offered to any selfsupporting woman wage-earner in this city".<sup>1</sup> Table XXX, showing the average weekly wage of 1133 women outside of Portland, indicates a similarly low rate of wages outside of the city. The average weekly wage in all except one occupation, stenography, is below the minimum of \$10. The Committee concluded that "The investigation has proved beyond a doubt that a large majority of self-supporting women in the state are earning less than it costs them to live decently--".<sup>2</sup>

The table showing the cost of living was prepared after consulting the schedules submitted by 509 women and after personal investigation of more than 100 rooming houses and boarding houses.<sup>3</sup> With reference to this estimate the Committee stated, "Investigation has shown that \$10 a week is the very least on which the average self-supporting woman can live decently and keep herself in health in Portland. This means a steady income of \$520 per year."<sup>4</sup>

---

1. Oregon; Consumers League, Social Survey Committee, Rept., p. 6. 1913.  
 2. Ibid., p. 24.                      3. Ibid., p. 57.                      4. Ibid., p. 67.

In Indiana figures are available for the wages of more than 18,500 women employed in stores and factories. The investigations were carried on simultaneously by the Federal Bureau of Labor and the Indiana State Commission on Working Women, the former covering the department and other stores and garment factories, the latter covering 38 industries other than the manufacture of garments. The results are summarized in the following tables.

Table XXXII

Per Cent of Women Receiving Less than Specified Weekly Wages in  
140 Department and Other Retail Stores in Indiana; Commissions  
and Premiums Excluded; Cumulative; Representative Week.

	No.	Under \$4	Under \$5	Under \$6	Under \$7	Under \$8	Under \$9	Under \$10	Under \$12	Over \$12
Indianapolis	2609	8.8	22.3	30.7	45.2	55.1	67.5	74.5	83.7	16.3
Terre Haute	677	15.5	27.2	36.0	49.9	61.7	69.7	75.3	85.4	14.6
Evansville	486	18.5	38.2	48.4	60.7	69.3	76.7	79.8	89.1	10.9
Fort Wayne	485	.6	5.8	20.0	34.8	49.3	62.3	69.5	82.9	17.1
South Bend	457	8.5	17.7	26.3	38.7	48.8	57.8	67.0	76.6	23.4
La Fayette	322	4.3	14.3	33.9	52.7	64.9	72.4	76.4	88.2	11.8
Sub-total	5036	10.6	22.0	31.9	46.3	56.9	67.6	74.1	84.0	16.0
Muncie	288	15.3	28.1	41.0	59.4	68.0	71.9	78.1	87.8	12.2
Hammond	207	7.2	18.4	37.7	63.3	76.3	82.6	84.5	90.3	9.7
Richmond	198	6.6	25.8	34.3	46.5	58.1	67.7	74.7	87.4	12.6
New Albany	120	18.3	40.8	52.5	63.3	71.7	79.2	83.3	94.2	5.8
Grand Total	5849	9.8	22.7	32.0	47.9	58.4	68.6	74.9	84.7	15.3

Table XXXIII

Per Cent of Women Receiving Less than Specified Weekly Wages in  
Department and Other Stores in Indiana; 711 Women Included; Com-  
missions and Premiums included; Cumulative; Representative Week.<sup>2</sup>

	No.	Under \$4	Under \$5	Under \$6	Under \$7	Under \$8	Under \$9	Under \$10	Under \$12	Over \$12
Indianapolis	314	16.2	30.3	36.6	46.5	56.4	55.6	71.3	81.8	18.2
Terre Haute	104	12.5	26.5	37.5	46.2	57.7	67.3	76.9	81.7	18.3
Evansville	130	22.2	37.3	50.0	66.7	74.6	81.0	84.1	92.1	7.9
Fort Wayne	58	1.7	12.1	24.1	36.2	46.6	58.6	60.3	77.6	22.4
South Bend	63	6.2	19.0	30.2	38.1	52.4	58.7	66.7	77.8	22.2
La Fayette	26	11.6	11.5	26.2	57.7	65.4	65.4	80.8	96.2	3.8
Total	711	14.5	27.8	37.2	48.9	59.0	67.4	73.5	83.5	16.5

1. United States; Bureau of Labor, Bulletin 160, "Hours, Earnings, and Conditions of Labor of Women in Indiana Mercantile Establishments and Garment Factories", p. 33. 1914.
2. Ibid., p. 34.

Table XXXIV

Actual Weekly Earnings of Women in Garment Factories; taken from Pay Rolls of 67 Factories for Representative Week; Cumulative<sup>1</sup>

	No.	Under \$4	Under \$5	Under \$6	Under \$7	Under \$8	Under \$9	Under \$10	Under \$12	Over \$12
Indianapolis	2268	13.6	20.6	32.8	43.1	54.6	64.8	73.2	86.9	13.1
South Bend	1585	19.1	31.1	44.8	58.3	72.7	83.7	91.5	98.3	1.7
Fort Wayne	891	15.8	28.2	42.5	56.8	71.9	80.9	88.7	95.5	4.5
Terre Haute	185	26.0	38.7	48.3	61.6	70.6	77.9	83.9	92.7	7.3
Evansville	123	22.4	32.3	49.8	65.5	77.1	85.7	91.1	94.6	5.4
Total	5352	16.9	26.8	39.8	52.1	64.9	74.9	82.7	92.5	7.5
Richmond, Muncie Hammond La Fayette New Albany	331	12.9	26.9	39.0	55.3	67.4	77.6	88.2	96.1	2.9
Grand Total	5643	17.2	27.5	40.3	52.8	65.5	75.4	83.3	92.9	7.1

Table XXXV

Average Weekly Earnings in 23 Industries and 131 Establishments;  
Indiana<sup>2</sup>

	\$4 to \$4.99	\$5 to \$5.99	\$6 to \$6.99	\$7 to \$7.99	\$8 to \$8.99	\$10 or over	Total
Number	38	448	2417	3210	415	363	6891
Per Cent	0.5	6.5	35.1	46.6	6.0	5.3	100.

1. United States; Bureau of Labor, Bul. 160, p. 74. 1914. Cited Above.
2. Ibid., p. 197. This investigation was made by the Indiana Commission on Working Women and the results published as an appendix to the above Report.

Table XXXII shows the wages paid to 5,849 women in stores. for a representative week. In the absence of an adequate investigation into the cost of living in Indiana it is impossible to draw accurate conclusions as to the percentage receiving less than a living wage, but the arrangement of the table shows plainly a low rate of wages. More than 22 per cent of the whole number were receiving less than \$5 per week, nearly one-third were earning less than \$6, more than 45 per cent less than \$7, and more than 55 per cent less than \$8 per week. It is interesting to note the variation in wage rates among the ten cities investigated. For instance, South Bend has 48.8 per cent, Evansville 69.3 per cent, Hammond 76.3 per cent, receiving less than \$8 per week. No evidence is at hand on which to base conclusions as to the cause of the variations. The cities do not vary greatly in size and the question suggests itself whether the cost of living would vary to the same extent.

Table XXXIII is introduced to show the wages of 711 women with commissions and premiums included. The data were obtained by an investigation of each one of the number. Taking this table in connection with the one just above, which shows wage rates, and comparing it with the totals for the same cities, it is seen that the percentages in the two tables receiving certain specified amounts correspond very closely. These facts support the conclusion of the investigators that the commission system in Indiana, while growing, has not, as yet, materially affected the earnings of women in department and other stores when the whole number are under consideration.<sup>1</sup> In keeping with the results of other investigations, the investigation in Indiana shows a lower level of wages among factory employees than among women employed in department stores. Table XXXIV gives the actual average wages of 5,843 women employed in 67 garment

---

1. United States; Bu. of Lab. , Bulletin 160, p. 36.



factories in the state, located in the ten cities named. Approximately 27 per cent of the whole number received less than \$5 per week; 40 per cent, less than \$6; 52 per cent, less than \$7; 65 per cent, less than \$8; and 83 per cent, less than \$9 per week. Considerable variation among the different cities is apparent, but the ranking according to wages paid is different from the ranking of the cities according to wages paid in the department stores. For example, Indianapolis workers in garment factories received higher wages than those of any other city, while the wages of those in department and other stores ranked third among the ten cities. South Bend ranked first as to wages paid store employees but fell to fifth place in the garment factories, the comparison being made on the \$8 level.

The figures presented in Table XXXV, giving the result of the investigation of the Indiana Commission on Working Women into 131 factories in the state, outside of garment factories, evidence a larger percentage getting less than \$8 per week but a smaller percentage getting less than \$7 or \$6, than in the garment trades. Of 6,981 workers, 7 per cent were earning less than \$6; 42 per cent, less than \$7; and 88.7 per cent, less than \$8 per week. Whatever the cause, the fact of low earnings in the industries investigated in Indiana is apparent from the foregoing tables.

The most extensive investigation of the wages of women in this country was that by the Bureau of Labor of the Federal Government, the results of which were published in a report of nineteen volumes under the title "Condition of Woman and Child Wage-Earners in the United States". The statistics in the following pages, bearing on wages in department stores, in the ready made clothing industry, and in the textile industry, are drawn from that report.



Taking up the subject of wages in department stores, as shown by the above report, it is found that a comparatively low rate of wages prevails. Three cities, Chicago, New York, and Philadelphia, were carefully investigated. The tables for these cities disclose the wages of more than 35,000 workers in such stores. In addition to these figures, a table giving the results of an investigation by the National Civic Federation into department stores in New York City is introduced.

Table XXXVI

Weekly Rates of Wages, 8 Department Stores, New York, Taken  
From Pay Rolls; Commissions and Part Time Workers Excluded<sup>1</sup>

	Cash Girls, Messengers, Wrappers		Saleswomen		Office Employees		Others Including Buyers		Total	
	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%
Under \$3	29	1.9	-	-	-	-	14	.5	43	.3
\$3 to 3.99	780	50.5	5	.1	109	4.7	124	4.2	1018	8.0
4 " 4.99	594	22.8	96	1.6	259	11.1	400	13.7	1349	10.6
5 to 5.99	93	6.0	241	5.6	477	20.5	251	8.6	1152	9.1
6 to 6.99	25	1.6	1155	19.4	482	20.8	265	9.1	1928	15.2
7 to 7.99	12	.8	1070	18.0	361	15.5	214	7.3	1657	13.0
8 to 8.99	8	.5	845	14.2	208	9.0	217	7.5	1278	10.0
9 to 9.99	2	.2	517	8.7	112	4.8	223	7.7	855	6.7
10 " 10.99	-	-	504	8.5	110	4.7	255	8.8	869	6.8
11 " 11.99	-	-	178	3.0	39	1.7	101	3.5	318	2.5
12 " 12.99	-	-	391	6.6	58	2.5	158	5.4	607	4.8
13 " 14.99	-	-	246	4.1	40	1.7	154	5.3	440	3.5
15 or over	-	-	602	10.2	71	3.0	523	18.4	1206	9.5
Totals	1544	100	5940	100	2327	100	2909	100	12780	100

Table XXXVII

Weekly Rates of Wages in 22 Stores, New York, Week Ending  
April 19, 1913; Commissions not included.<sup>2</sup>

	Saleswomen		Ass't Buy.		Alteration		Others		Total	
	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%
Under \$3	0	-	-	-	23	.17	6	.07	29	.02
\$3 to 3.99	1	.01	-	-	21	.99	603	7.39	625	3.18
4 " 4.99	26	.29	-	-	95	4.01	1828	22.41	1949	9.93
5 " 5.99	161	1.82	-	-	129	5.44	1154	14.14	1444	7.36
6 " 6.99	1462	16.49	-	-	268	11.30	1393	17.08	3123	15.91
7 " 7.99	1777	20.04	1	.43	151	6.37	979	12.00	2908	14.81
8 to 8.99	1497	16.88	1	.43	235	9.91	692	8.48	2425	12.36
9 " 9.99	966	10.89	5	2.15	212	8.94	402	4.92	1585	8.08
10 " 10.99	863	9.73	4	1.72	284	11.99	232	4.07	1483	7.56
11 " 11.99	326	3.68	5	2.15	129	5.45	137	1.67	597	3.04
12 " 12.99	584	6.59	16	6.87	197	8.32	192	2.35	989	5.04
13 " 13.99	144	1.62	5	2.15	73	3.08	59	.72	281	1.45
14 " 15.99	489	5.52	27	11.59	206	8.69	168	2.06	890	4.54
15 or over	571	6.14	169	72.51	547	14.64	212	2.59	1309	6.62
Totals	8867	100.	233	100.	2370	100.	8157	100.	19627	100.

1. United States; Bureau of Labor, Rept., "Condition of Woman and Child Wage Earners in the United States", Vol. V, p. 146.
2. National Civic Federation; Welfare Dept., Rept., National Civic Federation Review, July 15, 1913.

Taking \$8 as a standard, which amount, according to the "elfare Committee of the National Civic Federation will cover only the bare necessities of the girl who boards, and using Table XXXVI, it is seen that 56.2 per cent of the 12,720 women investigated by the Federal Bureau of Labor received less than that sum. Of the cash girls, inspectors, wrappers, etc., who represent the youngest employees, 99.3 per cent received less than \$8 per week. Of the saleswomen, 44.7 per cent, and of office employees, 72.6 per cent received less than that sum.

Table XXXVII, embodying the results of the investigation of the National Civic Federation, indicates the wages received by nearly 20,000 employees. Since commissions are excluded, the actual earnings would be somewhat higher than the rates given but to just what extent the figures would be caused <sup>to vary</sup> cannot be determined. It will be noted that the wages shown in this table are a little higher than in the preceding table for the same city, but on the whole the figures tend to confirm the investigation made by the Federal Bureau of Labor. According to this table, more than one-half of the 19,627 reported earned less than \$8 per week which was held to be a mere necessity standard. Of the saleswomen, 38.65 per cent received less than that amount.

Eight department stores in Chicago were investigated and data gathered for more than 13,000 women workers. A comparison of the wages indicated in the table below with that giving the wages of workers in New York City shows a great similarity between the wages of department store girls in the two cities. In Philadelphia, <sup>six</sup> department stores were investigated. Here, as in the other cities, the figures were taken from the pay rolls and commissions were excluded. Nearly 10,000 workers are included in the second table below.

Table XXXVIII

Weekly Rates of Wages, 8 Department Stores, Chicago, Taken From Pay Rolls; Commissions and Part Time Workers Excluded.<sup>1</sup>

	Cash Girls Messengers Wrappers etc		Saleswomen		Office Employees		Others Including Buyers		Total	
	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%
Under \$3	185	12.2	-	-	2	.1	23	.7	210	1.6
\$3 to \$3.99	399	26.6	1	-	103	4.6	101	3.3	604	4.6
" \$4.99	376	24.9	52	.8	336	15.1	214	6.9	880	7.4
" \$5.99	275	18.2	421	6.7	370	16.5	209	6.8	1275	9.7
" \$6.99	142	9.4	1339	21.2	413	18.4	278	9.0	2172	16.5
" \$7.99	64	4.3	1023	16.2	373	16.6	322	10.7	1742	13.6
" \$8.99	46	3.1	898	14.2	273	12.2	371	12.0	1588	12.1
" \$9.99	14	.9	645	10.2	117	5.2	414	13.4	1190	9.0
" \$10.99	5	.3	560	8.9	88	3.9	354	11.6	1011	7.7
" \$11.99	-	-	179	2.8	35	1.6	90	2.9	304	2.3
" \$12.99	2	.1	315	5.2	53	2.4	181	5.8	571	4.3
" \$14.99	-	-	230	3.6	34	1.5	128	4.1	397	3.0
\$15 or over	-	-	629	10.1	44	1.9	356	12.8	1071	8.2
Totals	1508	100.0	6312	100.0	2243	100.0	3097	100.0	18160	100.0

Table XXXIX

Weekly Rates of Wages, 6 Department Stores, Philadelphia, Taken From Pay Rolls; Commissions and Part Time Workers Excluded.<sup>2</sup>

	Cash Girls Messengers Wrappers etc		Saleswomen		Office Employees		Others Including Buyers		Total	
	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%
Under \$3	431	26.1	-	-	1	.1	24	1.1	456	4.6
\$3 to \$3.99	445	27.0	-	-	75	.3	154	7.0	674	6.8
" \$4.99	406	24.7	25	.6	153	8.9	189	8.6	773	7.8
" \$5.99	129	7.8	281	6.5	317	18.4	167	7.6	894	9.0
" \$6.99	151	9.2	1068	24.7	381	22.1	332	15.1	1932	19.5
" \$7.99	60	3.6	957	22.2	270	15.6	331	15.0	1618	16.4
" \$8.99	19	1.1	612	14.2	167	9.7	292	13.3	1090	11.0
" \$9.99	3	.2	372	8.2	116	6.7	166	7.5	657	6.6
" \$10.99	1	.1	411	9.5	99	5.7	147	6.7	658	6.7
" \$11.99	-	-	104	2.4	34	2.0	36	1.6	174	1.8
" \$12.99	1	.1	225	5.2	29	1.7	85	3.9	340	3.4
" \$14.99	-	-	129	3.0	38	2.2	37	1.7	204	2.1
\$15 or over	-	-	136	3.1	46	2.6	240	10.9	422	4.3
Totals	1646	100.0	4320	100.0	1726	100.0	2200	100.0	9892	100.0

1. United States; Bureau of Labor, Rept., "Condition of Woman and Child Wage-Earners in the United States, Vol. V, p. 107.

2. Ibid., p. 160

Though no estimate of the cost of living in Chicago is given, the same figure used above for a living wage, \$8, may be used for the purpose of gathering briefly the significance of the figures given.

Of the 13,000 and more employees included in Table XXXVIII, 53.4 per cent or more than one-half, were receiving less than \$8 per week. Of the saleswomen, 44.9 per cent; of the office employees, 71.3 per cent; of the other employees, including buyers and assistant buyers, 37.4 per cent; and of the cash girls, messengers, packers, etc., 95.6 per cent received less than \$8 per week.

The data for Philadelphia, given in Table XXXIX, cover 9,892 employees. Of the total number, 64.1 per cent; of the cash girls, messengers, wrappers and packers, 98.5 per cent; of the saleswomen, 54.0 per cent; of the office employees, 69.4 per cent; and of the other employees, including buyers and assistant buyers, 54.5 per cent were receiving less than \$8 per week.<sup>1</sup>

An investigation of home conditions was made in the above cities but the number investigated was much smaller in each city than the number included in the tables above. The women chosen, however, were considered representative. Of those in Chicago, 79.2 per cent were living at home and 20.3 per cent were adrift.<sup>2</sup> Of a smaller number investigated as to disposition of earnings, it was found that 78.7

- 
1. In addition to the three cities named, the report of the Bureau of Labor covers Boston, St. Paul, Minneapolis, and St. Louis, but the meagerness of the report on these cities prevents their inclusion above. The same low rate of wages prevails, so far as the figures go. Thus, in Boston the average wage in stores was \$7.15, in the Twin Cities \$6.95, while in St. Louis 57.4 per cent received less than \$6 per week. The first three of the four cities are situated in states now having minimum wages laws applying to women.
  2. United States; Bu. of Lab., Rept., "Condition of Woman and Child Wage-Earners in the United States". Vol. V, p. 115.



per cent turned over their entire earnings to the family, 17.4 per cent contributed a part of theirs, while only 3.9 per cent paid none of their earnings into the family fund.<sup>1</sup>

In New York, 92.1 per cent of the 391 representative women investigated were living at home and only 7.9 per cent adrift.<sup>2</sup> An investigation of 344 workers with regard to contribution to the family fund showed that 84.3 per cent turned over all their income, 11.9 per cent gave a part of theirs, and 3.8 per cent gave none of their earnings to the family.<sup>3</sup>

In Philadelphia, 56.8 per cent of the 264 women investigated contributed all, 39 per cent a part, and 4.2 per cent none of their earnings to the family.<sup>3</sup> In the same city, an investigation of 419 women workers disclosed the fact that 77.8 per cent lived at home and 28.2 percent were living adrift.<sup>2</sup>

The figures relative to the contributions made by those living at home to the family fund tend to show that the common notion that many of the wage-earning women living at home work merely to earn spending money is erroneous. Those living at home and turning over their earnings to the family must get back from the family all the necessities that the woman adrift must purchase. Viewed in that light, the fact that a large majority are living at home becomes of minor importance so far as the claim to a living wage is concerned.

---

1. United States; Bureau of Labor, Report, "Condition of Woman and Child Wage-Earners in the United States". Vol., V, p. 120.

2. Ibid., p. 115.

3. Ibid., p. 20, 21.

The investigation of the condition of wage-earning women in the men's ready made clothing industries in the United States is relatively very important for the reason that those industries employ a greater number of women than any other branch of manufacture, the cotton industry excepted. This investigation, as set forth in the report cited, covered 244 factories located in five different cities, viz,- Chicago, New York, Baltimore, Philadelphia, and Rochester. Of the 23,683 women employed, 10,149 are covered in the tables of wages given. Inasmuch as 68.3 per cent of all men's ready made clothing produced in the United States is manufactured in these five cities, the tables give a fair statement of the wage conditions of women in that industry. The following tables summarize the results of the investigation.



Table. XL.

Actual Earnings, Representative Week, of Female Employees  
16 years of age and over in Mens' Clothing Industry  
Classified by Amounts Earned in Five Leading Centers of Trade.

	Chicago		Rochester		New York		Philadel.		Baltimore		Total	
	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%
Under \$2	102	2.8	14	1.0	54	2.2	25	2.6	149	8.6	344	3.4
Under \$3	230	6.4	35	2.5	191	7.7	107	11.1	384	22.2	947	9.3
Under \$4	480	12.4	96	7.0	515	20.6	240	24.8	714	41.3	2045	20.1
Under \$5	885	24.7	219	16.0	914	36.5	378	39.8	1061	61.4	3457	34.0
Under \$6	1343	37.5	430	31.4	1312	52.4	551	57.9	1328	76.9	4974	49.0
Under \$7	1772	49.5	661	48.3	1666	66.5	678	71.0	1500	86.9	6288	62.0
Under \$8	2192	61.2	802	65.9	1942	77.5	779	80.4	1603	92.9	7419	73.0
Under \$9	2555	71.3	1087	79.4	2122	84.8	843	87.0	1664	96.4	8271	81.5
Under \$10	2872	80.2	1201	87.8	2271	90.7	886	91.4	1696	98.3	8926	88.0
Under \$11	3094	86.4	1278	93.4	2367	94.5	919	94.8	1719	99.6	9377	92.4
Under \$12	3244	90.6	1212	96.0	2408	96.1	941	97.1	1724	99.9	9630	94.9
12. and over	308	8.4	54	4.0	98	3.9	28	2.9	1	.1	519	5.1
	3589		1367		2506		969		1725		10149	

Table. XLI

Earnings, Actual, Representative week, Mens Clothing Industry  
Classified in more detail by Age Groups.

City and Age	Number	Under \$6	\$6 to \$8	\$8 and over
<u>Chicago</u>		%	%	%
16 to 20 years	2063	42.7	25.9	31.4
21 years and over	1519	30.4	20.8	48.8
All Ages	3885	42.2	22.1	35.8
<u>Rochester</u>				
16 to 20 years	540	41.8	40.2	18.0
21 years and over	827	24.7	30.8	44.5
All ages	1366	32.7	34.0	33.3
<u>New York</u>				
16 to 20 years	1146	59.0	25.7	15.3
21 years and over	1360	46.8	24.6	28.6
All ages	2538	52.8	25.0	22.2
<u>Philadelphia</u>				
16 to 20 years	488	62.1	24.4	13.5
21 years and over	481	53.6	20.6	25.8
All ages	1048	60.8	21.0	18.2
<u>Baltimore</u>				
16 to 20 years	1004	80.5	15.4	4.1
21 years and over	721	72.1	16.7	11.2
All ages	1903	79.0	14.6	6.4

1. Rept., U. S. Bureau of Labor, "Condition of Woman and Child Wage-Earners in The United States". Vol., II. p. 131.
2. Ibid., pp. 142-145.

Since no evidence as to the cost of living is at hand no definite statement of the percent of women earning less than a living wage can be made. But a glance at Table XL indicates that the wages of the workers are low. Taking, for the purposes of comparison, the rate of \$8 per week, which is a reasonable minimum for bare necessities according to the estimate for New York City made by the welfare department of the National Civic Federation, the table shows 61.2 per cent in Chicago, 65.8 per cent in Rochester, 77.5 per cent in New York, 80.4 per cent in Philadelphia, and 92.8 per cent in Baltimore, receiving less than that sum per week. It should be noted that the table gives wages only for those 16 years of age and over.

Table XLI gives in a little more definite form the wages of women by age groups. Taking those 21 years of age and over and using the same sum, \$8, for comparison, the table shows that 51.2 per cent in Chicago, 55.5 per cent in Rochester, 71.4 per cent in New York, 74.2 per cent in Philadelphia, and 88.8 per cent in Baltimore receive less than that amount. It is interesting to note that there is a wide variation in the wage rate among the different cities. Baltimore, for example, shows a very low rate in comparison with Chicago or Rochester. In that city, 61.4 per cent of the women reported received less than \$5 per week, while in Chicago only 24.7 per cent and in Rochester only 16.0 per cent received less than that sum. Whether the cost of living would vary to the same extent is doubtful.

In considering the clothing industry the home workers should not be neglected. It is in home work that the problem of the "sweated" industry is found in its most acute form. The extent to which women are employed in home work is not shown in the report of the Bureau. The

Investigation in the five cities named above covered 674 women doing home work and the figures given in the tables following are deemed representative of wage conditions in that branch of the industry.

Table XLII

Full Time Earnings of 674 Women Home Workers in Mens Clothing Industries in Chicago, New York, Rochester, Baltimore, Philadelphia; Classified by Earnings per Week.<sup>1</sup>

Per Cent Earning Specified Am'ts.	Per Cents Arranged Cumulatively
Under \$1.50 - - - - - 2.1	Under \$1.50 - - - - - 3.1
\$1.50 to \$2 - - - - - 8.9	Under \$2 - - - - - 12.0
\$2 to \$3 - - - - - 29.9	Under \$3 - - - - - 41.9
\$3 to \$4 - - - - - 29.3	Under \$4 - - - - - 71.2
\$4 to \$5 - - - - - 15.1	Under \$5 - - - - - 86.3
\$5 to \$6 - - - - - 7.7	Under \$6 - - - - - 94.0
\$6 to \$7 - - - - - 3.5	Under \$7 - - - - - 97.5
\$7 to \$8 - - - - - 0.9	Under \$8 - - - - - 98.4
\$8 and over - - - - - 1.2	\$8 and over - - - - - 1.3

Table XLIII

Actual Yearly and Weekly Earnings of Home Workers in Same Industry and Cities, Employed one Year or More<sup>2</sup>

	Chicago	Rochester	New York	Philadelphia	Baltimore	Total Av
Per Week	\$2.59	\$3.77	\$2.31	\$2.67	\$2.35	\$2.42
Per Year	\$140	\$196	\$120	\$139	\$122	\$126

1. United States; Bureau of Labor, Rept., "Condition of Woman and Child Wage-Earners in the United States"; Vol. II, p. 227.  
 2. Ibid., p. 228.

As would be expected, the first table given shows a very low rate of wages. It should be noted that the figures given in this table are not actual wages but rates for full time work. Working full time, 98.4 per cent of the 674 would earn less than \$8 per week. These rates of wages are considerably higher, however, than the actual average earnings shown in the next table, XLIII, which shows the yearly and weekly earnings of those working a year or more. A very slight study of the table shows miserably low earnings.

Of the 674 women, 556 were married, 84 widowed or divorced, and 34 single.<sup>1</sup> An investigation of the husbands of 527 married women showed the average yearly earnings of the husbands to be \$291<sup>2</sup>, or \$5.59 per week; and the average yearly income of the families from all sources to be \$515,<sup>3</sup> or \$9.90 per week.

We come now to the third part of the Federal investigation into conditions of wage-earning women and children. The textile industries of the New England and the Southern States constitute a large field of employment for women and children and at comparatively low wages. The tables setting forth the results of the investigations show the earnings, for a representative week, of more than 31,000 women and girls employed in 192 establishments located in 10 different states. Table XLIX shows the wages of more than 14,000 workers in New England textile factories.

- 
1. United States; Bureau of Labor, Rept., "Conditions of Woman and Child Wage-earners, etc." Vol. II, p. 223.
  2. Ibid., p. 243.
  3. Ibid., p. 246.



Table XLIV

Earnings of Female Workers in Textile Industries for Representative Week, Classified by Age, State, and Number, and Per cent in each Age Group; New England States Group<sup>1</sup>

	Employees		Under \$4	Under \$6	Under \$8	Under \$10
	No.	%				
<u>Maine</u>						
Under 16 years	245	7.9	42.0	83.7	98.8	100.0
16 years and over	2839	92.1	16.1	41.9	70.5	88.1
<u>New Hampshire</u>						
Under 16 years	38	6.6	44.7	94.7	100.0	100.0
16 years and over	536	93.4	19.4	51.1	80.4	95.9
<u>Massachusetts</u>						
Under 16 years	316	3.9	37.7	75.9	94.6	98.1
16 years and over	7705	96.1	13.7	40.4	68.7	87.1
<u>Rhode Island</u>						
Under 16 years	242	8.3	35.1	69.0	93.8	99.6
16 years and over	2669	91.7	7.6	24.4	57.7	80.0
<u>Totals</u>						
Under 16 years	841	5.8	38.5	77.1	95.8	99.2
16 years and over	13744	94.2	12.2	38.0	67.4	86.4
Grand Total	14585		14.7	40.2	69.0	87.1

1. United States, Bureau of Labor, Rept., "Condition of Woman and Child Wage-Earners in the United States", Vol. I, p. 209.

Taking up Table XLIV for study, it is seen that of those employees who were 16 years of age and over, 38.0 per cent received less than \$6 and 67.4 per cent less than \$8 per week. If one were to take \$8 as a basis for comparison, which was the minimum arrived at by the Massachusetts Minimum Wage Commission in its early estimate, one finds, in round numbers, 70 per cent in Maine, 80 per cent in New Hampshire, 68.7 per cent in Massachusetts, and 57.7 per cent in Rhode Island, 16 years of age and over, receiving less than that sum. The variations from state to state are to some extent accounted for by the differences in the number of hours worked during the representative week.<sup>1</sup> It is interesting to observe the low percentage of girls under 16 years of age employed, in comparison with the percentage under the same age in the Southern group, the former being 5.8 per cent and the latter 25.9 per cent. Another important observation in regard to age should be made, and that is, that very little difference in the per cent of employees receiving less than any given amount per week is found to exist when those under 16 years of age are included or excluded from the totals. For example, 67.4 per cent of those 16 years of age and over received less than \$8, while 69.0 per cent of all ages received less than that amount. At the \$6 level the percentages are 38.0 and 40.2 ; and at the \$10 level 86.4 and 87.1.

Except the home workers in the clothing industry, no class of workers reported in any of the investigations were receiving such low wages as are shown in the table below giving the results of the investigation of the textile industry in the southern States. No

- 
1. The hours actually worked during the week were as follows; Maine, 50.2; New Hampshire, 46.2; Mass., 49.6; Rhode Island, 52.1; cf. Vol. I, p. 300 of the report cited above.



evidence is at hand upon which to base conclusions as to the relation of these earnings to the cost of living, but in view of the results arrived at in other sections of the country, after making all discounts possible, it is evident that a majority of the workers were receiving less than a living wage.<sup>1</sup>

---

1. The mills in New England turn out, generally, a higher grade product than the Southern mills, requiring to some extent more skilled and efficient workers. This should be borne in mind in comparing wages in the two sections.

Table XLV

Earnings of Female Workers in Textile Industries for Representative Week, Classified by Age, State, and Number and Per Cent in Each Age Group; Southern States<sup>1</sup>

	Employees		Per Cent Earning			
	No.	%	Under \$4	Under \$6	Under \$8	Under \$10
<u>Virginia</u>						
Under 16 years	209	19.0	60.3	87.6	99.0	100.0
16 and over	891	81.0	29.2	58.0	77.0	94.3
<u>North Car.</u>						
Under 16 years	1038	26.6	53.3	88.8	99.6	99.9
16 and over	2856	73.4	25.2	67.0	93.3	99.1
<u>South Car.</u>						
Under 16 years	1444	30.2	55.9	89.5	98.6	99.9
16 and over	3236	69.8	34.3	68.6	97.2	97.8
<u>Georgia</u>						
Under 16 years	881	11.3	63.9	91.4	98.9	99.8
16 and over	3241	78.7	34.0	66.9	89.9	97.9
<u>Alabama</u>						
Under 16 years	593	27.6	75.5	96.6	100.0	100.0
16 and over	1557	72.4	42.4	78.8	94.4	99.0
<u>Mississippi</u>						
Under 16 years	247	24.2	67.2	95.1	99.6	100.0
16 and over	773	75.8	30.9	64.0	92.2	99.5
<u>Total</u>						
Under 16 years	4412	25.9	60.4	90.9	99.2	99.9
16 and over	12654	74.1	32.6	68.0	92.5	98.1
Total All Ages	17066		39.8	73.9	94.2	98.6

1. United States; Bureau of Labor, Rept., "Condition of Woman And Child Wage Earners in the United States", Vol. I, p. 310.

Taking \$6 as a minimum, and no investigation has taken so low a sum as a decent living wage, it is seen from Table XLV, that 68 per cent of the women, 16 years of age and over, received less than the sum named. Taking the states singly, Mississippi had 64 per cent; Alabama, 78.8 per cent; Georgia, 66.9 per cent; South Carolina, 68.6 per cent; North Carolina, 67 per cent; and Virginia, 58 per cent, 16 years of age and over, earning less than \$6.<sup>1</sup>

Here again, but in a more striking degree, is seen evidence of the fact that the youth of part of the employees does not affect the per cent of the total receiving any given average to the extent one might suppose, or as is popularly believed. Of the total number included in the table, more than one-fourth were below the age of sixteen years. Of that one-fourth more than 90 per cent were receiving less than \$6 per week. Yet, including them all and comparing the percentages at the different levels, we find a difference of only 7.2 per cent at the \$4 level, 4.1 per cent at the \$6 level, 1.7 per cent at the \$8 level, and .5 per cent at the \$10 level, between those above 16 years of age and those of all ages.

#### Causes of Low earnings.

The figures introduced have been sufficient to show that there is a real problem of low earnings in connection with the employment of women and children. The problem extends over different sections of the country and is not confined to one occupation or industry, though it is more acute in some industries than in others and in some sections than in others. But thus far the problem has only been stated. The application

---

1. The average hours actually worked during the representative week were as follows; Virginia, 50.1; North Carolina, 54.6; South Carolina, 48.6; Alabama, 48.6; Georgia, 49.4; Mississippi, 53.9. This may, to some extent, explain the differences in wages among the different states, but it would not explain the variation, say, between Alabama and Georgia.

of statistics, in so far as they are available, to the causes of low earnings among women remains. It is essential to the success of any legislation that it be based on a knowledge of the causes of the given problem. Nothing so delays the progress of needed legislation as the passing of laws without proper and necessary machinery to connect the intention of the makers of the laws with the practical conditions. The resulting breakdown of such attempts not only hinders the solution of the problem dealt with, but casts reproach on efforts in other lines.

The discussion of the causes of low earnings presents a more difficult field and the statistics available are fewer, but the tables introduced in the following pages have important bearing on some of the matters to be taken up. Probably the first cause that suggests itself as an explanation of low earnings is the youth of the employees. There can be no doubt that youth is an important factor in the problem, but a careful study of the tables used above to show the low earnings of women by age groups leads to the conclusion that the importance of youth can easily be exaggerated and overestimated. Attention has been called from time to time in the discussion of the various tables where age groupings were given to the fact that when the whole number of women employed in a given industry are taken into consideration, the youth of those under 16 or 18 years of age or even higher, as reflected in their extremely low earnings, does not eliminate the problem of low earnings. So far as possible, the grouping according to ages has been used in an effort to exclude the low earnings of the very young from the totals, and to show the wages of those of more mature years. In addition to the statistics as to age given in the preceding pages, the two tables given below, XLVI and XLVII, showing the relation of age and experience to low earnings should be considered.

Table. XLVI.

Average Weekly Earnings, by Age-Groups and Experience, of 684  
Women Employed in Department and Other Retail Stores in Indiana.<sup>1</sup>

Yrs. Exp.	Age Groups											
	14 to 16		16 to 18		18 to 22		22 to 25		25 to 30		30 to 35	
	No.	Av. Earn	No.	Av. Earn	No.	Av. Earn	No.	Av. Earn	No.	Av. Earn	No.	Av. Earn
1 yr-	45	\$3.12	45	\$4.25	29	\$5.74	11	\$5.28	7	\$6.19	6	\$7.25
1 yr	4	2.98	29	4.42	15	5.55	9	7.94	6	6.12	5	6.55
2 "	-	-	14	4.09	22	5.20	5	8.66	6	9.51	5	7.57
3 "	-	-	3	3.27	28	6.77	12	7.39	7	7.85	3	7.45
4 "	-	-	2	6.17	25	6.63	7	7.47	3	7.32	2	7.50
5 "	-	-	1	5.00	15	7.71	11	9.15	15	7.84	7	9.55
6 "	-	-	-	-	11	6.58	11	7.88	14	10.17	6	10.61
7 "	-	-	-	-	7	6.43	6	7.86	4	9.13	3	15.20
8 "	-	-	-	-	1	6.35	18	8.57	8	13.25	5	9.17
9 "	-	-	-	-	-	-	3	8.21	7	7.84	1	15.00
10"	-	-	-	-	-	-	1	9.00	21	11.25	7	10.17
11"	-	-	-	-	1	6.30	-	-	3	11.28	2	9.74
12"	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	5	12.43	2	15.00
13"	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	6	11.43	1	11.88
14"	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	1	11.00	3	12.50
15"	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	7	10.55
16"	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	1	14.00
17"	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	2	11.93
20"	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	2	11.37
Tot.	49	3.11	94	4.30	154	6.26	94	7.83	113	9.59	70	9.90

	TOTAL				No. Av. Earn.	
	35 to 40	40 to 50	50 to 60	60 or over	No.	Av. Earn.
1 yr.	6	8.22	-	-	155	\$4.90
1 "	1	7.50	-	-	71	5.44
2 "	3	9.28	1	7.40	58	6.23
3 "	1	7.50	-	-	55	7.03
4 "	4	13.70	-	-	45	7.70
5 "	3	19.12	-	-	57	9.28
6 "	4	10.03	-	-	46	8.81
7 "	4	15.00	-	1 20.00	26	10.03
8 "	3	7.98	-	-	39	9.75
9 "	5	-	2 11.00	-	18	9.05
10 "	1	11.75	1 14.29	-	35	11.25
11 "	3	11.00	-	-	11	11.00
12 "	5	17.06	-	-	15	13.33
13 "	2	11.75	-	-	11	11.54
14 "	2	10.50	-	-	8	10.68
15 "	2	9.63	-	-	11	10.57
16 "	1	12.00	-	-	3	13.67
17 "	-	-	-	-	2	11.93
18 "	1	12.74	-	-	4	13.56
20 plus	7	10.73	2 8.85	2 17.00	14	11.18
Tot.	52	11.62	6 10.23	3 18.00	684	7.74

1. Bul. 160 U.S. Bu. of Lab. "Hours, Earnings, and Conditions of Labor, Women in Indiana Mercantile Establishments and Garment Factories," 1914. p.47-48.

**Table. XLVII**  
**Average Weekly Earnings, by Age Groups and Experience, of 508**  
**Women Employed in Garment Factories in Indiana.<sup>1</sup>**

Age Groups												
Yrs.	14 to 16		16 to 18		18 to 22		22 to 25		25 to 30		30 to 35	
Exp.	No.	Av. Earn.	No.	Av. Earn.	No.	Av. Earn.	No.	Av. Earn.	No.	Av. Earn.	No.	Av. Earn.
1 yr.	32	\$3.49	18	\$5.03	16	\$5.63	8	\$6.08	5	\$5.47	4	\$5.82
1 "	9	4.88	9	5.15	14	6.76	1	8.50	2	4.65	1	12.01
2 "	--	----	18	6.26	18	7.12	5	6.46	6	7.95	1	7.12
3 "	--	----	3	6.78	23	7.62	5	7.12	2	7.75	2	8.12
4 "	--	----	1	4.50	12	7.29	8	8.76	11	8.62	2	8.50
5 "	--	----	--	----	21	7.47	8	6.52	6	9.02	3	10.14
6 "	--	----	--	----	3	7.48	11	7.10	7	10.15	3	9.08
7 "	--	----	--	----	3	7.94	7	10.10	7	8.93	1	10.00
8 "	--	----	--	----	1	5.39	11	8.78	6	8.89	3	9.91
9 "	--	----	--	----	--	----	5	8.73	14	9.02	1	7.50
10 "	--	----	--	----	--	----	3	7.29	18	8.54	4	10.17
11 "	--	----	--	----	--	----	1	10.00	6	9.96	1	8.37
12 "	--	----	--	----	--	----	1	7.50	4	9.94	7	9.24
13 "	--	----	--	----	--	----	--	----	1	12.00	2	8.38
14 "	--	----	--	----	--	----	--	----	2	10.45	2	13.25
15 "	--	----	--	----	--	----	--	----	1	7.50	6	9.00
16 " plus	--	----	--	----	--	----	--	----	--	----	7	9.63
Total	41	3.80	49	5.53	111	7.07	74	7.78	68	8.75	50	9.19

						Total				
	35 to 40	40 to 50	50 to 60	60 or over	No.	Av. Earn.				
1 yr.	5	\$6.26	2	\$4.56	1	\$4.53	93	\$4.79		
1 "	5	8.40	1	8.00	--	----	42	8.30		
2 "	1	10.00	2	8.00	--	----	51	6.98		
3 "	3	13.40	2	9.05	1	5.00	41	7.96		
4 "	1	13.00	3	7.75	--	----	38	8.16		
5 "	3	7.57	3	8.00	1	7.00	45	7.72		
6 "	1	9.25	1	9.00	--	----	26	8.35		
7 "	1	8.50	--	----	1	7.24	20	9.05		
8 "	2	8.52	3	8.20	--	----	27	8.71		
9 "	--	----	--	----	--	----	20	8.88		
10 "	6	9.58	1	7.46	1	6.83	23	8.81		
11 "	2	8.45	2	8.64	--	----	12	9.36		
12 "	2	6.30	2	7.21	2	8.75	18	8.75		
13 "	1	11.00	1	12.57	--	----	5	10.46		
14 "	1	13.00	--	----	--	----	5	12.08		
15 "	4	7.94	2	7.67	--	----	13	8.35		
16-over	5	9.62	12	9.41	3	7.35	29	8.69		
Total	44	8.82	27	8.53	11	6.80	2	4.73	508	7.51

<sup>1</sup> Bul. 160, U.S. Bu., Lab., pp. 82-83. "Hours, Earnings and Conditions of Labor of Women in Indiana Mercantile Establishments and Garment Factories". 1914.



Taking the totals representing the average weekly earnings of the different age groups, it is seen that the maximum is reached between the ages of forty and fifty. The numbers for the age groups above 50 years are too small to support any conclusion. The table shows the earnings in mercantile establishments by age, but an average wage for a given group is not wholly satisfactory. One is interested in knowing the range of wages at which the different members of the group are employed and the number receiving those amounts. The table for the garment trades shows a gradual increase in the age groups, but reaching a maximum between the ages of 30 and 35. After all deductions and corrections possible are made for youth, there still remains a problem of low earnings of large proportions.

Closely connected with the factor of youth in the problem of low earnings is the matter of inexperience. Data bearing on the relation of inexperience to low wages are limited. That such relation exists is not to be doubted, but the extent to which it enters into the low earnings of women workers cannot be definitely determined. One fact that should not be forgotten is that by reason of the nature of the occupations in which a majority of the women are employed, the proper period of apprenticeship is short and therefore the time that is necessary to transform an inexperienced into an experienced worker is short.

The two tables given above relating to age and inexperience in department stores and garment factories in Indiana indicate, though not very clearly, that there is a relation between earnings and experience. Taking the totals with regard to experience in mercantile establishments as shown in Table XLVI, an increase in the average earnings with added years of experience is seen, though there is some irregularity after the



four year period is reached. In the garment factories a much smaller increase is noted but still a relation is apparent between experience and earnings. To measure properly, however, the relation between various wage levels with the percentages earning them would have to be used rather than the average wage. It is worth while noting, in connection with the bearing of youth and inexperience on the earnings of women, that in so far as the question of the minimum wage is concerned, a properly drawn law makes provision for the youth and inexperience of workers.

The two following tables are taken from the report of the Federal Bureau of Labor and deal with the matter of experience as affecting earnings.

Table. XLVIII.

Earnings of 1391 women in Department Stores and Other Stores  
Classified according to experience.<sup>1</sup>

Length of Experience	Number	Per cent	Average Weekly Earning
Under 1 year	170	12.2	\$4.69
1 year and under 2 years	176	12.6	\$5.28
2 " " " 4 "	327	23.5	\$6.27
4 " " " 6 "	241	17.3	\$7.49
6 " " " 8 "	165	11.9	\$7.83
8 " " " 10 "	105	7.6	\$9.27
10 " " " 12 "	68	4.9	\$9.81
12 " " " 16 "	78	5.6	\$9.95
16 " " " 21 "	39	2.8	\$13.33
21 " " " 30 "	18	1.3	\$11.55
30 " " " over	4	.3	\$11.38
	1391	100.	\$ 7.22

Table. XLIX.

Earnings of 3421 factory workers: showing classification  
according to Length of Experience in the business.<sup>2</sup>

Length of Experience	Number	Per Cent	Average Weekly Earnings
Under 1 year	575	16.8	\$4.62
1 year and under 2 years	475	13.9	5.34
2 " " " 4 "	925	27.3	6.16
4 " " " 6 "	563	16.5	7.03
6 " " " 8 "	315	9.2	7.36
8 " " " 10 "	175	5.1	7.96
10 " " " 12 "	125	3.7	8.48
12 " " " 16 "	111	3.2	8.49
16 " " " 21 "	79	2.3	8.54
21 " " " 30 "	49	1.4	8.08
30 " " " Over	19	.6	6.51
	3421	100.	6.36

- 
1. Bu. of Lab. "Condition of Woman and Child Wage-Earners in the United States", Vol. V. p. 42.
  2. Ibid., p. 47. The investigation covered seven cities, viz,- Chicago, Boston, Minn., St. Paul, New York, Philadelphia and St. Louis.

Table XLVIII shows the experience and average weekly earnings of 1,391 women in department stores in seven cities. From this table it is seen that the \$8 per week average was not reached by any group with less than an average experience of eight years, and that 77.5 per cent have less than that amount of experience. It is also seen that even with long experience the rates are low and that comparatively few reach the higher pay levels.

The next table gives the same facts with respect to 3,421 factory workers in the same cities. As usual, the wage rates are lower and the opportunities for advancement less than in the mercantile establishments. The \$8 average is not reached by any group with less than that number of years of experience. These figures indicate what the factories investigated hold out in the way of earnings for those with long experience.

The Board of Public Welfare in Kansas City gave some attention to the relation of experience to earnings and the results are given in the following tables.

Table. L

Wages and Experience of 656 Piece workers in Garment  
Factories in Kansas City, Missouri

Time in Industry	Wage received by largest number	No. receiv- ing it	Highest Wage received	No. receiv- ing it	Lowest Wage received	No. receiv- ing it	Total in each group
Under 6 wks.	\$5 - \$7	6	\$6 - \$7	3	Under \$3	1	12
6 wk. - 3 mo.	\$5 - \$6	6	\$7 - \$8	1	Under \$3	1	11
3 mo. - 6 mo.	\$4 - \$5	7	\$7 - \$8	3	\$4 to \$5	7	19
6 mo. - 1 yr.	\$5 - \$6	14	\$12 - \$14	1	Under \$3	2	41
1 yr. - 2 yr.	\$6 - \$7	40	\$10 - \$12	6	Under \$3	4	156
3 yr. - 5 yr.	\$7 - \$8	23	\$10 - \$12	11	Under \$3	1	101
5 yr. - 10 yr.	\$7 - \$8	25	\$14 - \$16	1	Under \$3	1	159
10 " or over	\$7 - \$8	27	\$16 & over	1	Under \$3	5	157

Table LI

Wages and Experience of 1,069 Women in Department Stores,  
Kansas City, Missouri.<sup>2</sup>

Experience	Under \$5	\$5 to \$6	\$6 to \$7	\$7 to \$8	\$8 to \$9	\$9 to \$10	\$10 to \$12	\$12 and over	Total in group
Under 1 yr.	15.6	37.9	29.9	9.3	4.4	2.1	0.8	0.3	385
1 yr. - 3 yr.	2.5	16.8	35.9	23.6	11.2	1.7	5.0	2.1	339
3 yr. - 5 yr.	1.6	5.5	25.6	20.6	21.0	9.2	11.7	4.6	238
5 yr. - 10 yr.	-	33.3	8.3	8.3	8.3	-	17.5	25.0	12
10 " or over	1.0	2.1	5.0	4.2	20.0	12.6	18.9	35.9	95
	7.1	20.7	28.4	15.9	11.7	4.5	6.4	5.2	1069

1. Kansas City, Missouri; Board of Public Welfare, 4th. Annual Rept., p. 202.  
2. Ibid., p. 242.

Table L presents the results of the investigation of 656 workers in garment factories, relative to the bearing of experience on wages. While the table is not well arranged some facts can be gleaned from it. Of the 656 workers, 83 had been employed less than a year and may properly be classed as learners. All of the remaining workers had been employed at least a year in the same industry, and in some cases more than ten years. Yet, the table shows the wages paid the largest number in each of the time groups 1 to 3 years, 3 to 5 years, 5 to 10 years, and over 10 years, were less than \$8 per week.

Table LI shows the earnings of 1,069 women employees in mercantile establishments, classified according to experience. Of this number two-thirds had less than 3 years experience. The small number of workers in the 5 to 10 years group renders any conclusion for that group untrustworthy. On the whole, the table indicates rising wages with added years of experience. For example, 92.4 per cent of those with less than 1 year of experience, 80 per cent of those with from 1 to 3 years experience, and 53.5 per cent of those with from 3 to 5 years experience were earning less than \$8 per week.

In the following tables we have the results of the investigation of laundry workers in Massachusetts .

Table.LII

Earnings of 1,101 Workers in Laundries in Massachusetts  
Classified According to Years of Experience.<sup>1</sup>

Years of Experience	Under \$4	\$4 to 5	\$5 to 6	\$6 to 7	\$7 to 8	\$8 to 9	\$9 and over	Total No.
Under 1 year	14.8	27.0	32.4	15.8	7.1	2.3	0.5	222
1 yr. to 2 yr.	-	17.4	32.6	22.7	16.7	6.0	4.6	132
2 " " 3 "	-	11.7	25.2	31.9	15.9	4.2	0.9	119
3 " " 4 "	0.9	9.8	21.6	27.5	25.4	10.8	3.9	102
4 " " 5 "	0.9	5.8	27.9	22.1	25.9	8.6	8.6	104
5 " " 6 "	-	3.7	8.3	30.0	18.3	20.0	20.0	60
6 " " 7 "	-	-	17.5	21.0	14.0	26.3	21.0	57
7 " " 8 "	-	-	11.1	26.9	23.8	23.8	14.3	63
8 " " 9 "	-	2.4	19.0	14.3	26.2	9.5	28.6	42
9 " " 10 "	4.0	-	8.0	8.0	24.0	20.0	36.0	25
10 " " 11 "	-	2.1	10.6	10.6	29.8	25.5	21.3	47
11 " " 12 "	-	-	-	-	37.5	12.5	50.0	8
12 " " 13 "	-	-	-	9.5	9.5	42.9	38.1	21
13 " " 14 "	-	-	12.5	6.2	12.5	12.5	56.2	16
14 " " 15 "	-	7.1	-	7.1	42.9	21.4	21.4	14
15 " and over	-	1.4	-	13.0	13.0	23.2	49.3	69
	3.2	10.8	22.4	20.6	17.9	11.9	12.9	1101

1. Massachusetts; Minimum Wage Commission, Bulletin No. 5, p. 41. 1914.



Table LII shows the earnings of 1,101 laundry workers, classified according to experience and earnings. Of the total number, 679, or 61 per cent, have less than five years experience. Wages tend to increase as the number of years of experience increases. Approximately 97 per cent of these with less than one year's experience received less than \$8 per week. Nearly 95 per cent of those with two years but less than three years experience received less than \$8. The per cents under \$8 per week decline as one goes down the table. It is worth noting, however, that though increased experience brings increased earnings, there are many who have considerable experience who earn less than a living wage. For example, 53 per cent of those with 10 to 11 years experience, 37.5 per cent of those with 11 to 12 years, 20 per cent of those with 12 to 13 years, and 27.5 per cent of those with 15 or more years experience received less than \$8 per week. It is evident too that youth could not be a material factor in determining the wages of those with ten or more years of experience.

On the whole, the data seem to show that even among experienced workers there is a large problem of low earnings and that while inexperience is one of the causes of low earnings, it plays a minor part when the whole number of employees is taken into consideration.

A third cause of low wages in inefficiency. The relation of inefficiency to wages presents one of the most difficult problems. That there is a causal relation running from inefficiency to low wages, especially among the young and inexperienced workers, all investigators agree, but no attempt, except indirectly - and that in a very few cases<sup>1</sup> - is made to measure the relation statistically. It is recognized, also, that there is a causal relation running from low wages to inefficiency and that, in a given case, it may be very difficult to determine which is the cause and which the effect or whether both are active.

---

1. The Board of Public Welfare of Kansas City, Missouri, made some investigations of the relation of general education to wages in factories and mercantile establishments. Of 1,101 factory workers, 1.4 per cent had no education, 46.5 per cent did not reach the eighth grade, 33.4 per cent completed the eighth grade, 15.9 per cent attended high school but did not graduate, and 2.7 per cent were high school graduates or above. The investigation showed no relation between educational training and wages.

Of 866 employees in mercantile establishments, only one had no education, 23.3 per cent left school before reaching the eighth grade, 32.1 per cent were eighth grade graduates, 28.1 per cent attended high school but did not graduate, and 16.5 per cent were high school graduates. Of those having less than eighth grade education 88.6 per cent received less than \$8 per week; of the number who were eighth grade graduates, 71.9 per cent earned less than \$8; of those attending high school but not graduating, 65.0 per cent received less than the sum named; and of those who were high school graduates and above, 51.0 per cent earned less than \$8 per week. These figures show higher wages were paid to the better educated employees, due, in part at least, to the greater efficiency resulting from a better general education. Cf. 4th. Annual Report of the Board, page 243.

The fourth of the important causes of low wages among women is exploitation. This is suggested by the variations in wages paid by different establishments in the same industry in the same city and under the same conditions. The youth and sex of the employees, their unorganized condition, and the lack of standards of employment, wages, hours, and conditions make variation and exploitation comparatively easy. The various reports of the Massachusetts Minimum Wage Commission treat the matter of variation among establishments in regard to wages in a complete manner. In commenting on the fact of variation the Commission stated, "This study has made it plain that great variation in wages exists between establishments, and that establishments paying higher wages exist and prosper in the same neighborhood with others whose wage level is decidedly lower. This fact is true of establishments with similar product, manufacturing for the same market, and for establishments with extreme variation in size of plant. The level of wages is usually in favor of the smaller"<sup>1</sup> The evidence adduced in the following tables sustains the conclusions of the commission and points to exploitation as one of the important causes of low earnings.

---

1. Massachusetts; Minimum Wage Commission, 1 st. Rept., p. 26. 1914.

Table LIII

Average Weekly Rates of Wages in Candy Factories in Massachusetts  
Classified by Establishments<sup>1</sup>

Establishment	Under \$4	Under \$5	Under \$6	Under \$7	Under \$8	Under \$9	\$9 and over
No. 1	--	9.7	43.4	70.5	87.8	93.3	6.7
No. 2	--	35.0	62.9	76.7	88.8	97.9	2.1
No. 3	--	21.7	42.0	57.3	73.2	92.9	7.1
No. 4	7.0	50.2	74.0	86.3	93.0	99.6	.4
No. 5	--	24.9	46.5	62.8	79.9	95.2	4.8
No. 6	3.4	39.1	56.2	71.9	88.5	100.0	--
No. 7	5.3	17.2	48.8	76.6	91.4	99.0	1.0
No. 8	--	32.5	63.6	83.1	93.5	98.7	1.3
No. 9	--	--	75.0	87.5	93.8	100.0	--
No. 10	--	56.4	74.5	85.5	90.9	90.9	9.1
No. 11 <sup>a</sup>	--	--	--	--	8.3	83.3	16.7
No. 12	--	--	--	12.5	12.5	87.5	12.5
No. 13	--	--	--	--	--	14.3	85.7
No. 14	1.2	26.0	53.5	72.2	86.3	96.0	4.0

1. Massachusetts; Minimum Wage Commission, Bulletin No. 4, p. 32. 1914  
a. Rates were not available for Establishment No. 11.

Table LIII shows the wages paid in thirteen factories some of which are in the same general locality and draw their labor supply from the same market. The variations are noticeable, particularly in the lower wage groups. Since the table gives rates of wages rather than earnings the question of hours worked or of unemployment cannot have any bearing as possible explanation of the variations. Three factories engage workers at weekly rates of less than \$4 per week. Establishment No. 4 and establishment No. 10 both show scheduled rates of less than \$5 per week for more than one-half their employees. Commenting on the variations shown the commission stated, "For example, establishment No. 1 and establishment No. 2, with approximately the same restrictions on their labor market and the market for their product, offer conspicuously different rates of pay, and the establishment which offers the higher rates continues to carry on business successfully".<sup>1</sup> Establishments No. 12, 13, and 14 are very small and manufacture a high grade of product, which accounts in part at least for their comparatively high rate of wages.

The variations in rates of pay for laundry workers are shown in the following table.

---

1. Massachusetts; Minimum Wage Commission, Bulletin No. 4, p. 23. 1914.

Table LIII shows the wages paid in thirteen factories some of which are in the same general locality and draw their labor supply from the same market. The variations are noticeable, particularly in the lower wage groups. Since the table gives rates of wages rather than earnings the question of hours worked or of unemployment cannot have any bearing as possible explanation of the variations. Three factories engage workers at weekly rates of less than \$4 per week. Establishment No. 4 and establishment No. 10 both show scheduled rates of less than \$5 per week for more than one-half their employees. Commenting on the variations shown the commission stated, "For example, establishment No. 1 and establishment No. 2, with approximately the same restrictions on their labor market and the market for their product, offer conspicuously different rates of pay, and the establishment which offers the higher rates continues to carry on business successfully".<sup>1</sup> Establishments No. 12, 13, and 14 are very small and manufacture a high grade of product, which accounts in part at least for their comparatively high rate of wages.

The variations in rates of pay for laundry workers are shown in the following table.

---

1. Massachusetts; Minimum Wage Commission, Bulletin No. 4, p. 23. 1914.



Table LIV

Average Weekly Rates of Wages in Laundries in Massachusetts;  
Classified by Establishments

Establishment	Under \$4	Under \$5	Under \$6	Under \$7	Under \$8	Under \$9	\$9 and over
No. 1	-	33.9	65.4	76.6	81.2	91.1	8.9
No. 2	-	(35.2) <sup>a</sup>	17.6	32.8	51.1	61.7	38.3
No. 3	-	-	2.0	24.3	50.7	69.6	30.4
No. 4	-	-	41.1	84.2	100.0	100.0	-
No. 5	-	-	59.5	73.0	83.3	89.7	10.3
No. 6	2.4	4.8	7.2	12.9	24.2	46.8	53.2
No. 7	-	-	-	75.3	86.5	97.8	2.2
No. 8	1.2	16.7	44.0	71.4	81.0	92.9	7.1
No. 9	-	-	-	47.1	89.2	97.0	3.0
No. 10	-	3.0	20.0	61.0	85.0	97.0	3.0
No. 11	-	23.2	67.9	68.4	81.0	90.5	9.6
No. 12	-	4.3	29.3	54.3	66.3	80.4	19.6
No. 13	-	-	8.1	37.2	75.6	87.2	12.8
No. 14	-	1.2	32.9	50.6	60.0	72.9	27.1
No. 15	-	39.0	60.9	90.2	93.9	96.3	3.7
No. 16	-	2.7	10.7	62.7	72.0	94.7	5.3
No. 17	-	4.2	17.0	27.8	70.9	90.2	9.7
No. 18	-	-	2.4	14.6	31.7	43.9	56.1
No. 19	-	-	12.0	23.9	40.3	62.7	37.3
No. 20	-	56.1	84.9	97.0	100.0	100.0	-
No. 21	8.5	57.1	77.7	92.0	96.8	98.4	1.6
No. 22	-	2.2	22.2	44.4	66.7	75.7	24.3
No. 23	-	-	30.2	56.6	88.7	100.0	-
No. 24	-	-	8.0	40.0	76.0	92.0	8.0
No. 25	-	-	31.4	68.6	78.4	88.2	11.8
No. 26	-	4.6	41.8	66.4	90.7	93.0	7.0
No. 27	-	-	37.5	85.0	92.5	95.0	5.0
No. 28	-	7.5	17.5	32.5	57.5	75.0	25.0
No. 29	-	-	12.8	48.7	56.4	71.8	28.2
No. 30	-	-	-	15.3	84.9	90.9	9.1
No. 31	-	-	-	13.3	80.0	93.3	6.7
No. 32	-	-	-	90.9	97.0	97.0	3.0
No. 33	-	-	2.3	30.0	50.0	96.7	3.3
No. 34	-	-	-	3.8	3.8	42.3	57.7
No. 35	-	-	-	-	-	78.0	22.0
No. 36	-	-	-	4.5	13.6	54.5	45.5
	2.4	10.0	29.5	55.1	71.6	84.0	16.0

the actual earnings are as follows:

1. Massachusetts; Minimum Wage Commission, Bulletin No. 5, p. 33, 1914.

a. Evidently a typographical error. The percentage must be something less than 17.8, the per cent given in the next column. Since only the percentages are given in the report it is impossible to rectify the error.

A wider variation is seen among the laundries than was noted among the candy factories. It should be remembered that the figures show rates and not earnings. A glance at the table, especially the lower wage groups, shows that no uniformity exists. Since no data are at hand to show the causes of the variations it is worth while to note the opinion of the commission where it states, "This striking variation among the wages paid in the various establishments becomes exceedingly important in the discussion of the possible increases in wages..... If it is possible for employers in the same business, in the same localities (for example, establishments No. 2 and No. 20, which are in the same city), to carry on business successfully, it would seem to be clearly indicated that the payment of high wages does not unduly handicap an establishment. It should be remembered, also, that the rates of wages have been left wholly to the employer and employee up to the present time, and that therefore it must be a question of employers' policy which is involved in the high rates in certain establishments."<sup>1</sup> The variation between the two establishments named are obvious without comment. The figures given in the table coupled with the the opinion of the commission indicate that exploitation and inefficiency on the part of the employers are responsible for a part of the variations found to exist.

The two following tables show the results of the investigation of the corset and the brush industries. Since wage rates are not available the actual earnings are used.

---

1. Massachusetts; Minimum Wage Commission, Bulletin No. 5, p. 25. 1914.

Table. IV.

Average Weekly Earnings by Establishments in the Corset Industry;  
Massachusetts; Per Cent Earning under specified amounts <sup>1</sup>

Establishment	Under \$4	Under \$5	Under \$6	Under \$7	Under \$8	Under \$9	\$9 and over
No. 1	8.2	17.6	33.6	51.5	66.3	82.7	17.3
No. 2	4.7	11.8	26.7	43.5	67.2	84.9	15.1
No. 3	19.3	35.2	45.5	63.6	77.3	87.5	12.5
No. 4	20.0	46.7	63.8	81.0	92.4	98.1	1.9
No. 5	12.0	21.5	41.1	61.4	78.5	89.9	10.1
No. 6	26.4	41.8	56.0	72.5	92.3	98.9	1.1
No. 7	2.1	4.9	13.3	28.7	37.8	56.6	43.4
No. 8	15.8	33.3	52.6	63.2	84.2	91.2	8.8
Total----	9.6	20.0	35.5	53.5	68.7	83.6	16.4

Table. LVI

Average Weekly Earnings by Establishments in the Brush Industry;  
Massachusetts; Per Cent earning less than specified amounts. <sup>2</sup>

Establishment	Under \$4	Under \$5	Under \$6	Under \$7	Under \$8	Under \$9	\$9 and over
No. 1	19.8	51.5	79.2	91.4	97.0	98.3	1.7
No. 2	18.4	34.2	56.8	69.5	82.6	90.0	10.0
No. 3	13.3	53.3	73.3	80.0	92.3	100.0	
No. 4			100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	
No. 5		50.0	50.0	50.0	50.0	50.0	50.0
No. 6	13.2	39.5	55.3	65.8	78.9	86.8	13.2
No. 7				9.1	36.4	36.4	63.6
No. 8			40.0	80.0	80.0	80.0	20.0
No. 9	17.6	41.2	47.1	70.6	82.4	100.0	
No. 10					25.0	25.0	75.0
No. 11		50.0	50.0	75.0	75.0	100.0	
No. 12		50.0	50.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	
No. 13				50.0	50.0	50.0	50.0
No. 14				33.3	100.0	100.0	
	17.6	42.7	66.2	79.1	88.6	93.0	7.0

1. First Annual Rept. Mass. Minimum Wage Commission, 1914, p. 55.

2. Ibid., p. 32.

In the corset industry, as shown in Table LV, the same variation as in the other industries is found. Six of these factories are located in Worcester, but just which six these are is not shown in the report. Any six taken together, however, show a considerable difference in wages paid by factories doing the same kind of business, drawing their labor supply from the same market, and selling their goods in competition. In Table LVI the results of the investigation of the brush industry with regard to wages paid by different establishments are shown. The variations at any given wage level are apparent without comment.

Considerable variation among department stores in New York and Chicago are shown in the tables below. In Chicago 26 stores were investigated by the Illinois Bureau of Labor Statistics, while the investigation of the New York stores by the National Civic Federation covered 16 stores.

Table LVII.

Showing variations in Average Weekly Earnings in different  
Department Stores in Chicago; 26 Stores, 2118 Workers.<sup>1</sup>

Estab.	No.	Av. Wkly. Earnings	Estab.	No.	Av. Weekly Earnings
A	17	\$7.39	N	60	\$7.31
B	10	10.40	O	26	6.67
C	30	7.17	P	16	5.91
D	20	5.75	Q	25	6.24
E	200	10.62	R	29	8.38
F	12	6.39	S	175	14.07
G	600	13.93	T	50	7.00
H	14	6.68	U	149	11.70
I	156	9.72	V	20	8.45
J	20	7.95	W	100	7.35
K	21	8.69	X	217	8.70
L	10	8.35	Y	70	13.74
M	60	8.81	Z	11	9.00

Table LVIII

Variations in wages among Saleswomen in Department Stores  
New York City: Commissions excluded.<sup>2</sup>

A	\$13.43	I	\$ 6.04	
B	8.21	J	8.61	
C	14.49	K	7.84	
D	7.38	L	11.51	
E	7.11	M	7.84	
F	8.90	N	9.02	
G	7.56	O	10.33	Gen. Av.
H	8.32	P	9.06	\$9.31

1. Illinois Bu. Lab. Statistics, 1908; p. 521.

2. Rept. Welfare Dept. National Civic Federation; National Civic Federation Review, July 15, 1913; p. 23.



The results shown in Table LVII indicate that no standards for wages of women exist. Wide variations occur and facts explaining them are absent. Thus the average weekly earnings for employees of "D" is \$5.75, while "J" has an average of \$7.95, "K" an average of \$8.69, "Y" an average of \$13.74, and "S" an average of \$14.07. Table LVIII gives similar data for saleswomen in 16 department stores in New York City. The same variations in average weekly earnings for the different stores are seen. Some of these stores are similarly located and are actual competitors. In such cases the only apparent cause for the difference is exploitation.

Taking up the conditions in department stores in Ohio, the next table below shows the number of establishments in each city reporting women employees, and the number and per cent of the total number in each city that are paying less than \$6 to any employee.



Table LIX.

Number of Establishments Employing Women; Number and Per Cent of those Establishments employing Women, 18 years of Age and Over at less than \$6 per Week; Ohio.<sup>1</sup>

	Total Establishments	Paying less than \$6 per week	
		No.	Per Cent
Cincinnati	88	47	53.4
Cleveland	118	35	29.6
Columbus	72	42	58.3
Dayton	33	10	30.3
Toledo	49	13	26.5
Cities of 25,000 to 100,000	135	79	58.5
Cities of 10,000 to 25,000	170	104	61.2
Towns of less than 10,000	421	230	57.0
	1086	560	51.6

1. Ohio; Industrial Commission, Rept., No. 1, p. 19. 1914.

Using the above table, it is seen that in Cincinnati, of 88 establishments, 53.4 per cent were paying some of their employees 18 years of age and over, less than \$6 per week. In Cleveland, 29.6 per cent of the establishments were paying girls of the same age less than that amount. In Columbus, the per cent was 58.3; in Dayton 30.3 per cent; in Toledo, 26.5 per cent. This does not mean, of course, that these establishments were not paying higher rates to some of the women employed, but that in each of the cities a large percentage of the establishments, doing a similar line of business, did not pay any of their employees less than \$6 per week after the age of 18 years had been reached. While other facts, none of which are given in the report, may account for the variations, the figures establish a prima facie case for exploitation as an important cause of low wages.

## CHAPTER II.

## AN ANALYSIS OF MINIMUM WAGE LAWS OF THE DIFFERENT STATES.

The second step in the study of the subject of the minimum wage is a consideration of the laws that have been passed in the several states which have thus attempted to deal with the problem of low earnings of women and children. Though no two laws are alike in all details they may be grouped according to fundamental differences or similarities. Viewed from the standpoint of the method of enforcement two types are found. The first type is that in which no provision is made for the mandatory enforcement of the orders or findings of the commissions. Two states, Massachusetts and Nebraska, have such laws. In those states provision is made for the publication of the names of employers violating the decrees and enforcement rests upon public opinion. In the second type, found in all the other states, the minima are enforceable, and violations of such decrees or findings are punishable as misdemeanors.

From the standpoint of the method of determination of a minimum wage there are likewise two types. The first type is found only in Utah. The distinguishing feature of the law in that state is the fact that rigid minimum wage rates for all industries are established in the law itself and no commission of any kind is provided for. The second type, which is found in the other states, prescribes no wage rates in the law itself, but defines a standard or living wage and gives to the commission the power to apply the standard to conditions by fixing wage rates for a given industry. In Arkansas the two types are combined.

The tabulation below gives in detail the substance of the laws of the various states. It will serve as a basis for the discussion.

## MINIMUM-WAGE LAWS IN THE UNITED STATES.

State	Application to		
	Terms of Labor Contract	Class of Employeess	Occupations
California (C. 324, Laws of 1913)	Wages, hours, and conditions of labor prejudicial to health, morals, or welfare of the workers	Women and Minors (under 18)	All occupations trades, or industries in which women and minors are employed
Colorado (C. 110, Laws of 1913)	Wages	Women and Minors (under 18)	Mercantile, manufacturing, laundry, hotel, restaurant, telephone, or telegraph business
Massachusetts (C. 706, Acts 1912 as amended by C. 673 and 330 Laws of 1913)	Wages	Women, learners, apprentices and minors (under 18)	All occupations in which women are employed and in which Commission has reason to believe that wages paid a substantial number are inadequate
Minnesota (C. 547, Laws of 1913)	Wages	Women and Minors (males under 21 and females under 18)	All occupations where the wages of one-sixth or more of the women and minors are less than a living wage
Nebraska (C. 211, Laws of 1913)	Wages	Women, learners and apprentices, and minors (under 18)	All occupations in which women are employed and in which the wages paid a substantial number are inadequate

1. This tabulation is taken from "The Journal of Political Economy," February 1914. It was published as an appendix to an article contributed by Professor Millis, "Some Aspects of the Minimum Wage" pp. 132-159. An analysis of the laws of Kansas and Arkansas, passed in 1915, has been added.

## MINIMUM-WAGE LAWS IN THE UNITED STATES

State	Application to		
	Terms of Labor Contract	Class of Employees	Occupations
Oregon (C. 62 Laws 1913)	Wages, hours, and insanitary conditions having a pernicious effect.	Women and Minors	All occupations where the wages and conditions of "any considerable number" are found unsatisfactory.
Utah (C. 63, Laws of 1913.)	Wages	Females only - women, learners, apprentices (for a period of not more than a year), and minors (under 18)	All occupations
Washington (C. 174, Laws, 1913)	Wages and Conditions of labor	Women and minors (under 18)	All industries or occupations.
Wisconsin (C. 712, Laws, 1913)	Wages	Women and minors (under 18)	All occupations
Kansas Laws, 1915	Wages, hours, and sanitary and other conditions	Women and minors (under 18 years)	All occupations
Arkansas Laws, 1915	Wages and hours	Females only	Manufacturing, mechanical or mercantile establishment, laundry, express or transportation company employing more than three women; except employees in cotton factories, those employed in preservation of fruits or perishable farm products, or gathering the same

1. The law is not very clearly drawn in this respect. The occupations named are those specifically named in the law as coming under the rates named in the law itself. Sec. 11, however, seems to give the commission power to fix wages in hotels, restaurants and telephones but such wages shall not be greater than the rates specified in the statute, Sec. 7.

## MINIMUM-WAGE LAWS IN THE UNITED STATES

State	Standards as defined	Standards fixed by -
California	(1) Not "less than a wage adequate to supply to such women and minors the necessary cost of proper living and to maintain the health and welfare of such women and minors"; (2) maximum hours consistent with health and welfare, provided they shall not exceed the maximum fixed by statute; (3) standard conditions of labor demanded by health and welfare	Industrial Welfare Commission of five, appointed by the governor. At least one member shall be a woman.
Colorado	"Suitable" wages in view of cost of living and financial condition of the business and the probable effect thereon of any increase in the minimum wage.	State Wage Board of three, appointed by the governor, one a representative of labor, another an employer. One shall be a woman
Massachusetts	Wages adequate "to supply the necessary cost of living and to maintain the workers in health," and suitable wages for minors.	Minimum Wage Commission of three appointed by the governor.
Minnesota	"Wages sufficient to maintain the worker in health and supply him with the necessary comforts and conditions of reasonable life"	Minimum Wage Commission of three appointed by the governor- the commissioner of labor and two others; one to be an employer of women, another a woman.
Nebraska	Wages "suitable" for female employees of ordinary ability in view of their needs, the financial condition of the occupation, and the probable effect thereon of any increase in the minimum wage paid, and suitable wages for learners and apprentices and minors	Minimum Wage Commission of four - the governor and three appointed by him. These to include the deputy commissioner of labor and the professor of political science at the State University. One to be a woman.



## MINIMUM-WAGE LAWS IN THE UNITED STATES

	Standards defined	Standards fixed by --
Oregon	Such wages as will cover the necessary cost of living of women of average ability, standard hours of labor, but not longer than those fixed by law, fair sanitary conditions, and suitable wages for apprentices, etc.	Industrial Welfare Commission of three appointed by the governor, one representing the employers, one the employees, and the other the public.
Utah	Minors, 75 cents per day; adult learners and apprentices, 90 cents per day; others \$1.25 per day.	Wages prescribed by statute.
Washington	"Such standards of wages for women and minors employed -- as shall be held hereunder to be reasonable and not detrimental to health and morals and which shall be sufficient for the decent maintenance of women.	An Industrial Welfare Commission of five -- the Commissioner of Labor and four others appointed by the governor. Persons who within five years have been members of a manufacturers' or employers' association or of a labor union are not eligible for appointment.
Wisconsin	"Shall mean compensation for labor paid ---, sufficient to enable the employee receiving it to maintain himself or herself under conditions consistent with his or her welfare.	Industrial Commission of three appointed by the governor.
Kansas	"--minimum wage, whether by the time-rate or piece-rate, required in the case of a woman worker of ordinary ability in the occupation in question to supply the necessary cost of living"-- and suitable minimum wages for learners and apprentices and minors.	Industrial Welfare Commission of three - the Commissioner of Labor and two appointed by the governor, one of whom shall be a woman,--no two of whom may be from the same congressional district. Persons related by blood or marriage to the Com. of Labor, or to any state officer or member of any other board or commission are not eligible to appointment.
Arkansas	Inexperienced, \$1.00 per day others, \$1.25. "Rate of wages adequate to supply the necessary cost of proper living, and to maintain the health and welfare of such woman or minor female worker	By statute but if, after investigation, the commission finds the minimum prescribed too low or too high it may raise or lower it to conform to the standard given.

## MINIMUM-WAGE LAWS IN THE UNITED STATES

State	Conference System	
	Employment	Composition of the Board
California	If, after investigation, the Commission finds conditions unsatisfactory, it <u>may</u> call a conference.	Equal number of representatives of employers and employees in occupation trade, or industry in question, with a member of the Commission as chairman.
Colorado	Public hearings to be held if demanded but no conference board provided for.	
Massachusetts	If the Commission finds wages inadequate in any occupation, it <u>shall</u> establish a wages board.	Not fewer than six representatives of employers, an equal number of representatives of female employees, and not to exceed one-half the number for each of these as representatives of the public.
Minnesota	The Commission at its discretion <u>may</u> establish an advisory board in any occupation.	Equal number of representatives - from three to ten - of employers and employees and one or more - but not to exceed one-third of the total number - disinterested persons to represent the public
Nebraska	If Commission, after investigation, finds wages of a substantial number inadequate it <u>shall</u> establish a wages board	The three appointed members of the Commission, not less than three employers, and an equal number of representatives of the female employees

## MINIMUM-WAGE LAWS IN THE UNITED STATES

State	Conference System	
	Employment	Composition of the board
Oregon	The Commission <u>may</u> establish conferences in trades where unsatisfactory conditions are found.	Equal number of representatives - not exceeding three - of employers and employees, and not more than three disinterested persons as representatives of the public.
Utah		
Washington	If, after investigation, the Commission finds wages and conditions unsatisfactory in any trade, occupation, or industry, it <u>shall</u> call a conference.	Equal number of representatives of employers and employees, one or more disinterested persons as representatives of the public - but not exceeding the number of representatives of each of the other parties - with a member of the commission as chairman.
Wisconsin	If, after investigation, the commission finds that the wages paid are less than a living wage, it <u>shall</u> appoint an advisory wage board.	"Selected so as to fairly to represent employers, employees, and the public.
Kansas	If, after investigation, the commission finds that in any occupation the wages, hours and sanitary conditions are prejudicial to the health or welfare of any substantial number of employees and are inadequate to supply the necessary cost of living and maintain workers in health, it <u>shall</u> establish a wage board.	Equal number of representatives of employers and employees - not less than three - and one or more disinterested persons appointed by the commission to represent the public.
Arkansas		

## MINIMUM-WAGE LAWS IN THE UNITED STATES

State	Conference System	
	Duties of Board	Recommendation Reported by -
California	Shall report to the Commission (1) estimates of minimum wages, (2) maximum hours, standards for conditions required under the law	Majority
Colorado		
Massachusetts	Shall report to the Commission suitable wages for women, learners, apprentices, and minors after considering their needs, the financial condition of the occupation, and probable effect thereon of any increase in the minimum paid, together with the names of employers paying less than the wage so determined.	Majority
Minnesota	Shall recommend an estimate of minimum wages sufficient for women and minors of ordinary ability, and for learners and apprentices.	"Majority of entire mem- bership"
Nebraska	Shall report to Commission suitable wages after considering the needs of the employees, the financial condition of the business, and the probable effect thereon of any increase in the minimum paid, together with the names of employers who pay less than the minimum wages recommended.	Two-thirds Majority

## MINIMUM-WAGE LAWS IN THE UNITED STATES

State	Conference System	
	Duties of the Board	Recommendation Reported by -
Oregon	May prescribe standards of hours of labor, sanitary conditions and wages, and report its recommendations to the Commission	Majority
Utah		
Washington	To recommend to the commission "an estimate of the minimum wage adequate --- to supply the necessary cost of living, and maintain the workers in health, and standards of conditions of labor demanded for the health and morals of the employees".	Majority
Wisconsin	To "assist in investigations and determinations" of the Commission.	
Kansas	To determine the minimum wage --- required in the case of a woman worker of ordinary ability in the occupation in question to supply the necessary cost of living and the number of hours and other sanitary conditions necessary to maintain her health, and suitable wages, hours, and sanitary conditions for learners and apprentices, and minors	Majority
Arkansas		

## MINIMUM-WAGE LAWS IN THE UNITED STATES

State	Hearings etc.	Review and Appeal
California	Commission to hold hearings at time and place specified, at least fourteen days' notice being given. Has power to subpoena witnesses, administer oaths, etc.	Mandatory order effective after sixty days. Published, mailed to county recorder and labor commissioner, and by him sent, so far as practicable, to employers affected. Review in Superior Court of three counties upon complaint filed within twenty days. May be set aside because (1) commission exceeded powers, or (2) determination secured by fraud.
Colorado	Board, after agreeing upon a wage determination, to give thirty days' notice of hearing by publication and to mail a copy "to the person, association, or corporation in the business". Has power to subpoena witnesses, call for books etc.	Orders effective after sixty days. To be published in the county or counties in which the business is located and mailed "to the person, association, or corporation engaged in the business". Appeal to District Court on ground that order is unlawful or unreasonable. Evidence limited to that presented to the Board.
Massachusetts	If any recommendation by wages board approved, Commission shall hold hearing after giving not less than fourteen days' notice to employers affected.	Wage decree by Commission shall be published in at least one newspaper in each county of the state. If any employer files sworn statement that compliance with decree would endanger prosperity of the business, its operation stayed until review. If the court finds that compliance with such decree would likely endanger prosperity of business, "an order shall issue from said court revoking same".
Minnesota	Shall hold hearings. Has power to subpoena witnesses, administer oaths etc.	Order to be effective after thirty days. To be mailed in so far as practicable to each employer affected. Upon request of approximately one-fourth of employers or employees in an occupation, Commission must reconsider rates.
Nebraska	If any recommendation of a wages board is approved, Commission shall hold hearings after not less than thirty days' notice to the employers affected.	Within thirty days of entering decree, Commission to publish material parts of its findings, together with the names of employers paying less than the minimum wage determined upon and the minimum wage paid by each such employer. If any employer files sworn statement that compliance with decree would endanger prosperity of the business, its operation shall be stayed until review. If court finds that compliance with such decree would likely endanger the prosperity of the business, "an order shall issue revoking the same"



## MINIMUM-WAGE LAWS IN THE UNITED STATES

State	Hearings etc.	Review and Appeal
Oregon	May hold hearings. Has power to subpoena witnesses, administer oaths, etc.	Order effective after sixty days. To be mailed, in so far as practicable, to employers affected, and to be posted by them. Orders reviewed by the court of Multnomah county only, and the Commission's findings as to facts final.
Utah		
Washington	Commission to hold hearings. Has power to subpoena witnesses, administer oaths, etc.	Mandatory order issued by Commission effective after sixty days. To be mailed in so far as practicable, to employers affected. Commission's findings final as to facts. Appeal on questions of law to any superior court.
Wisconsin	Commission to hold hearings. Has power to subpoena witnesses, administer oaths etc.	Commission's findings as regards facts final. Review upon appeal to Superior Court of Dane County. Appeal on ground that Commission has exceeded its authority or that action was obtained by fraud.
Kansas	May hold hearings. Has power to subpoena witnesses, administer oaths, compel production of wage records, papers, etc.	Order effective after sixty days. To be mailed, in so far as practicable, to employers affected, and to be posted by them. Orders reviewed by the district court of Shawnee County or in the district court of the county in which the complainant resides or has his principal place of business. Appeal on the ground that unauthorized by law, confiscatory or unreasonable; findings of fact by Commission are final.
Arkansas	May hold public hearings	Orders effective at once. No review by courts provided

## MINIMUM-WAGE LAWS IN THE UNITED STATES

State	Permits to Slow Workers, etc.	Enforcement	
		Observance	Books and Records
California	Commission "may issue to a woman physically defective by age or otherwise a special license authorizing the employment of such licensee, for a period of six months (license renewable), for a wage less than such legal minimum wage and the Commission shall fix a special minimum wage for such person".	Mandatory.	Employer shall "keep a record of the names, ages, and residences of all women and minors employed."
Colorado	Where time wages only are ordered, the Board may issue to a woman physically defective a permit to work for a lower wage, provided, it is not less than the specified minimum fixed in the case.	Mandatory	None prescribed.
Massachusetts	Commission may issue a permit to a physically defective woman to work for less than the legal minimum rate, provided, that it is not less than the special minimum wage fixed for that person		Employer to keep register of names, ages, and addresses of all women and minors employed.
Minnesota	Where time wage ordered, Commission may issue to a woman physically defective a permit to work for a lower specified wage. The number of such persons not to exceed one-tenth of the whole number of workers in any establishment	Mandatory	Employer to keep register of names and addresses and wages of women and minors employed; also hours employed per day or week.
Nebraska	Where time wages only are ordered, Commission may issue a permit to a physically defective woman to work for less than the legal minimum, provided, that it is not less than the special minimum in the case		Employer to keep register of names and addresses of women and minors employed.

## MINIMUM-WAGE LAWS IN THE UNITED STATES

	Permits to Slow Workers, Etc.	Enforcement	
		Observance	Books and Records
Oregon	Where a minimum time wage is fixed, the Commission may issue to a woman physically defective, or crippled by age or otherwise, a license to work for a prescribed lower wage	Mandatory	Employer shall keep a register of the names, ages, and residence addresses of all women and minors employed.
Utah	None provided for	Mandatory	
Washington	Commission may issue to a woman physically defective or crippled by age or otherwise, or to an apprentice in such occupations as usually require to be learned by apprentices, a special license to work for a lower prescribed wage.	Mandatory	Employer to keep a record of all women and minors employed by him
Wisconsin	"The Industrial Commission shall make rules and regulations whereby any female or minor unable to earn the living wage --- shall be granted a license to work for a wage --- commensurate with his or her ability." The license shall specify the wage.	Mandatory	Employer shall keep a record of the names and addresses of all women and minors employed by him, and such other records as the Commission may require
Kansas	The Commission may issue to an employee physically defective or crippled, or of less than ordinary ability, or learners, apprentices, and minors a special license authorizing the employment of such person at a wage less than that fixed by the commission to be stated in the license.	Mandatory	Employer shall keep a register of all women, learners and apprentices, or minors employed by him in such form as the Commission shall prescribe.
Arkansas	None provided for	Mandatory	Employer to keep record of names, wages, hours, hours of beginning and ending each day's work and lunch period.

## MINIMUM WAGE LAWS IN THE UNITED STATES

	Enforcement	
	Prosecution	Penalty
California	Complaint of under-payment may be registered by any person, and the Commission shall investigate the matter and take all proceedings necessary to enforce the payment of a wage not less than the living wage".	Paying less than minimum wage fixed, a misdemeanor, punishable by fine of not less than \$50, or by imprisonment for not less than thirty days, or by both such fine and imprisonment.
Colorado	Justices of the peace have jurisdiction within their respective counties of all offenses arising under this act.	Violations of act or order a misdemeanor, punishable by fine not to exceed \$100, or by imprisonment not to exceed three months, or by both such fine and imprisonment.
Massachusetts	Commission from time to time to determine whether employers are obeying its decrees.	If decrees not complied with, names of offending employers to be published in at least one newspaper in each county of the state.
Minnesota	Commission shall enforce provisions of the act and its orders.	Violations of act or order a misdemeanor, punishable by of \$10 to \$50 or by imprisonment for from ten to sixty days.
Nebraska	Commission from time to time to determine whether employers obeying its decrees	Names of employers not obeying decrees to be published.

## MINIMUM-WAGE LAWS IN THE UNITED STATES

State	Enforcement	
	Prosecution	Penalty
Oregon		Violation of orders punishable by fine of from \$25 to \$100, or by imprisonment for from ten days to three months, or by both such fine and imprisonment.
Utah	Commissioner of Immigration, Labor and Statistics, to enforce act, but violations to be prosecuted by officers as in other misdemeanor cases.	Paying less than the wage prescribed in the law a misdemeanor.
Washington	Commission to investigate complaints and proceed in behalf of the workers	Violation of any order or of any provision of this act a misdemeanor, punishable by fine of from \$25 to \$100.
Wisconsin	Commission to investigate complaints and "take all proceedings necessary to enforce the payment of a wage not less than the living wage	
Kansas	to time Commission from time to time to ascertain whether employers or employees are observing and complying with its orders and take necessary steps to prosecute those not observing and complying with its orders.	Violation of the act or of an order a misdemeanor punishable by fine of not less than \$25 nor more than \$100.
Arkansas	Commissioner of Labor to cause the provisions of the act to be enforced and to have full police power in enforcing compliance with such provisions	Violation of or non-compliance with provisions of the act a misdemeanor punishable by fine of not less than \$25 nor more than \$100. Applies to females also.

## MINIMUM-WAGE LAWS IN THE UNITED STATES

	Enforcement Recovery	Miscellaneous Provisions
California	Employee paid less than minimum applicable may recover in a civil action the unpaid balance, together with costs of suit, an agreement to accept less notwithstanding.	Annual appropriation of \$15,000 to carry out provisions of the act; Biennial reports to be made.
Colorado	Employee receiving less than the minimum wage applicable may recover in a civil suit balance due, together with costs and attorney's fees, an agreement to accept less notwithstanding.	Appropriation of \$5,000 for carrying out provisions of the act. Report to November 30, 1914 to be made
Massachusetts		Annual reports to be made to the General Court.
Minnesota	Employee redeiving less than the minimum applicable may recover in a civil suit the balance, with costs and attorney's fees, an agreement to accept less notwithstanding.	Annual appropriation of \$5,000 to carry out the provisions of the act. Biennial reports to be made.
Nebraska		Biennial reports to be made to the governor.



## MINIMUM-WAGE LAWS IN THE UNITED STATES

State	Enforcement Recovery	Miscellaneous Provisions
Oregon	Employee receiving less than minimum wage applicable may recover in civil suit balance due, with reasonable attorney's fees, an agreement to accept less notwithstanding.	Annual appropriation of \$3,500 to carry out provisions of the act. Biennial reports to be made.
Utah		
Washington	Employee receiving less than wage fixed may recover in civil action the balance due, with costs and attorney's fees, an agreement to accept less notwithstanding.	Annual appropriation of \$5,000 to carry out the provisions of the act. Biennial reports to be made.
Wisconsin		
Kansas	Employee receiving less than the minimum wage or for greater number of hours than that fixed, may recover in civil action the full amount of the legal minimum wage and compensation at the same rate for the number of hours over-time as provided in the act.	Biennial reports to be made to the governor and legislature.
Arkansas		

- A glance at the tabulation shows that various titles have been used by the different states in naming the commissions. In the three Pacific coast states, California, Oregon, and Washington, and in Kansas, where the powers of the commission are broader than that of fixing wages, the commissions are called the Industrial Welfare Commission. In Massachusetts, Nebraska, and Minnesota the commission is designated the Minimum Wage Commission. In Colorado the board is called the State Wage Board. In Wisconsin the Industrial Commission has been invested with power to make minimum wage rates. In Arkansas no title is given the commission. While no commission is created in Utah the enforcement of the law in general devolves upon the Commissioner of Immigration, Labor and Statistics.

The commissions are composed of five members in California and Washington, four in Nebraska, and three in the other states. In Colorado, California, Minnesota, Kansas and Nebraska at least one of the members must be a woman. In Arkansas two of the three must be women. Colorado and Minnesota require one employer on the board. In Oregon both employers and employees must be represented. In Washington, Kansas, Nebraska, and Arkansas, and Minnesota the commissioner of labor is ex officio a member of the board. Nebraska has the unique requirement that one of the members must be a professor in the department of political science in the state university. In that state the governor is also ex officio a member. An interesting feature of the law in Washington is the exclusion from membership on the commission of any person who is, or, within the preceding five years, has been a member of any labor union or employers' or manufacturers' association. No two members of the commission in Kansas can be from the same congressional district. Except in Arkansas, where the commissioner of labor and statistics appoints one member, the appointments are made by the governor. In Wis-

consin the consent of the senate is also necessary. The terms of office vary. No limit is prescribed in Arkansas. In Colorado, Minnesota, and Nebraska the appointments are for two years; in Massachusetts and Oregon three years; in California, Kansas, and Washington, four years; and in Wisconsin, six years. Save in Wisconsin, an annual salary is allowed in no case. Necessary expenses are allowed in all except Arkansas, and in California and Massachusetts the members receive ten dollars a day for actual service. In all the states except Arkansas and Nebraska provision is made for a paid secretary.

It will be noted from the table above that the powers of the commissions are confined to the fixing of minima for females and minors. In Utah and Arkansas the law applies to females only. This indicates that the laws have been based on the conviction that there is a clear distinction between the status of women and children and that of men in American jurisprudence. Whether the distinction is wholly justifiable is of no importance in the practical discussion of the powers of the commission since a constitutional bar would nullify a law regulating the wages of men in private industry, except, perhaps, in extremely hazardous occupations. It is well that the laws have been wisely drawn in this respect since to attempt to broaden their scope so as to include men would vitiate the attempt to establish standards of wages for women.

In most of the states having minimum wage laws the powers of the commissions are confined to the fixing of wages, but in the Pacific coast states and in Kansas certain incidental powers are given. In Washington the commission has power to fix standards of wages and conditions of labor. In California, Kansas, and Oregon the commissions have power to fix standards of wages and conditions of labor, and in

addition they have the power to fix maximum hours.

The jurisdiction of the commissions in most of the states is general and not confined to any stated occupations or industries. In Colorado, however, the power of the commission to fix rates is confined to the mercantile, manufacturing, laundry, hotel, restaurant, telephone or telegraph business. The rates fixed in the Arkansas law apply to manufacturing, mechanical or mercantile establishments, express or transportation companies employing more than three women, except cotton factories and industries having to do with the gathering and preservation of fruits and farm products. Another section of the law, however, seems to give the commission power to fix the wages of women employed in hotels, restaurants, and telephone exchanges at a rate not greater than the rates prescribed in the law. In Massachusetts, Kansas, Nebraska, and Oregon the commission can fix wages only when in their opinion the wages paid a substantial number of the female employees are inadequate to supply the necessary cost of living. In Minnesota the commission may establish a minimum wage where, after investigation, it is of the opinion that the wages paid one-sixth or more of the women or minors employed in a given occupation are less than living wages. In the other states the power to fix wages can be exercised when any of the employees falling within the scope of the law are earning less than the defined standard.

The duty of making investigations of wages is imposed on the commissions in a majority of the states, and all the states invest their commissions with that power. In Oregon the commission is "empowered" to make such investigations. In Minnesota and Kansas the commissions may at their discretion make investigations but such investigation becomes mandatory in the former upon petition of one hundred employees

in a given occupation, and in the latter upon petition of twenty-five employees in an occupation in which women or minors are employed.

In carrying on any investigation authorized by law the commissions have power to subpoena witnesses, administer oaths, and conduct hearings. Where records are kept in compliance with a provision of the law to that effect the commissions or their agents have the right of access to and inspection of such records. They may compel the production of books, papers, and other records bearing on the questions at issue in the hearings.

Since it is the duty of the commission to ascertain the facts and apply regulations in accordance with a standard laid down in the law, it is important that the standards of the various states be considered. The minimum prescribed in California is not less than a wage adequate to supply such women and minors the necessary cost of living and to maintain the health and welfare of such minors and women. In Colorado, after investigating the cost of living and considering the financial condition of the business and the probable effect thereon of any increase in the minimum wage paid the board is bound to fix suitable minimum wages. In Arkansas the minimum wage is one adequate to supply the necessary cost of living, and to maintain the health and welfare of the employees. In Kansas it is unlawful to employ women, learners and minors at wages which are not adequate for their maintenance, and the commission is empowered to fix a minimum wage required in the case of a worker of ordinary ability to supply the necessary cost of living. The standard set in Massachusetts is a wage suitable for a female employee of ordinary ability and suitable wages for minors. In Minnesota the minimum set is a wage sufficient to maintain the worker in health and supply her with the necessary comforts and conditions of

reasonable life. Nebraska defines the standard as a minimum wage suitable for an employee of ordinary ability in the occupation in question. In Oregon the minimum wage is such as will supply the necessary cost of living to workers of average ordinary ability in the occupation in question, and maintain them in health. Washington requires as a minimum wage a sum that will supply the necessary cost of living, and maintain the workers in health. The Wisconsin law defines the term "a living wage" to mean compensation for labor pain sufficient to enable the employee receiving it to maintain himself or herself under conditions consistent with his or her welfare. The rates fixed in the Utah law are as follows; minors, under the age of eighteen years, not less than seventy-five cents per day, "adult learners and apprentices" not less than ninety cents, and experienced adults not less than one dollar and twenty-five cents per day. The rates prescribed in the Arkansas law are; not less than one dollar and twenty-five cents for females with not less than six months experience, and not less than one dollar per day for those with less than six months experience. The tabulation shows in more detail the standards or definitions of minima in the different states.

Except in Arkansas, Utah, and Colorado provision is made for the establishment of an advisory board, or, as it is called in Oregon and Washington, a conference. Such boards are advisory only and their findings are in all cases subject to revision or rejection by the commission. They carry on their activities under rules and regulations prescribed by the commission, and the latter have exclusive jurisdiction over all questions arising in reference to the validity of the procedure and determination of these wage boards. In Kansas, Wisconsin, Massachusetts, and Nebraska the establishing of such boards is mandatory but in the last only in so far as the wages of women are concerned. In the other states the commissions may establish them at their discretion.



In making up the personnel of the wage boards or conferences, the requirements vary, though in all cases the number representing employers and employees must be equal. In California, in addition to an equal number from each of these two groups, there must be a representative of the commission on the board. In Massachusetts at least six representatives from employers and a like number from the employees, together with one or more representatives of the public, the latter not to exceed one-half the number of representatives of either of the other parties, make up the wage board. In Minnesota there must be from three to ten representatives of employers and of employees and one or more representatives of the public, but not to exceed the number of representatives of either of the other parties, and at least one-fifth of the entire number on the board must be women. In Kansas the board is composed of not less than three representatives of employees, an equal number of representatives of employers, and of one or more disinterested persons appointed by the commission to represent the public. In Nebraska three representatives of the employers, three of the employees, and the three appointed members of the commission constitute the board. In Oregon three representatives of employers and three of employees, together with one or more members of the commission to represent the public, make up the conference. In Washington the conference is composed of an equal number of representatives from the employers and from the employees, one or more disinterested persons to represent the public, but not to exceed in number the number of representatives of either of the other parties, and a member of the commission to act as chairman. In Wisconsin the board must be selected so as to represent fairly the employers, the employees and the public.

In Oregon and Wisconsin the commissions appoint all the members of the wage boards. In California, Kansas, Massachusetts, Minnesota,

and Washington the commission appoints the members representing the public. In Nebraska the appointed members of the commission are ex officio the representatives of the public on the wage boards. Except in the two states where the commissions appoint all the members of the wage boards, the employers and employees choose their representatives, subject to the rules and regulations of the commission. As a rule the members of the wage boards or conferences are unpaid, but in California they receive five dollars a day and necessary travelling expenses, and in Massachusetts, Kansas, and Nebraska they receive remuneration at rates allowed to jurors, and necessary travelling and clerical expenses.

The powers and duties of the wage boards are in no case broader than the powers resident in the commissions. The whole function of a wage board is that of supplying an agency through which the wage commission works. In general then, the duties in the various states are as different as the powers given the commissions. In California the duty of the board is threefold, to report to the commission an estimate of minimum wages for the occupation, standard conditions of labor, and maximum hours. The duties of the board in Kansas are similar to those in California. In Massachusetts and Nebraska the board is required to report its determinations of minimum wages for the given trade after careful consideration of the needs of the employees, the financial conditions of the trade, and the probable effect thereon of any increase in the minimum wage paid. The wage board in Minnesota has the duty of recommending to the commission an estimate of minimum wages sufficient for living wages for women and minors of ordinary ability. In Oregon the conference must report concerning maximum hours, standards of conditions of labor, and minimum wages for women and minors. It is the duty of the board in Washington to recommend to the commission an estimate of the minimum wage adequate to supply the necessary cost of living and keep the workers in health and to recommend standards of

conditions of labor consistent with the health and morals of the employees. The wage boards in Wisconsin are required to assist in the investigations and determinations of the commission. The powers of the boards are implied in the duties enumerated. Their power to make investigations, hold hearings, summon witnesses, and examine books and records necessary to the proper determination of the matters in hand is the same as that of the commissions.

To make a valid recommendation a two-thirds majority is required in Nebraska, a majority of the entire membership of the board in Minnesota, and a plain majority in Kansas and Massachusetts. In the other states nothing is specified as to the number required to make a valid recommendation in which case a majority would be sufficient. When the commission has received the recommendations from the board it may accept them in toto or in part, or reject them entirely. If the recommendations are rejected they may be referred back to the wage board for further consideration, or the commission may cause a new board to be elected, and submit the matter to it.

After the commission has accepted a recommendation and before it makes its decree, it is required to hold public hearings at which interested parties have the right to appear and be heard on the issues involved. In Arkansas, Washington, and Oregon, the commissions are required to specify times for holding hearings at which times employers, employees, and other interested parties may appear. In the other states, the laws require that the commission shall file notice of the public hearings to be held on the given report of the wage board. In California and Massachusetts fourteen days must elapse between the service of the notice and the hearing; in Oregon and Kansas the period is four weeks; and in Colorado and Nebraska, thirty days. Where the commission has power to establish rates without the aid of a wage board the same rules as to notice and hearings must be observed.

Upon the conclusion of the hearings, the commission, at its discretion, draws up its final orders which become effective at once or after a prescribed period of time. In Minnesota, Wisconsin, and Nebraska, the orders become effective after thirty days; in California, Colorado, Kansas, Oregon, and Washington, after sixty days; while in Arkansas, and Massachusetts no time is specified. So far as it is practicable, copies of the orders are mailed to all employers affected by them. In Colorado, California, Kansas, Minnesota, Oregon and Washington, but a failure to receive a copy does not relieve an employer from compliance with the orders. To secure further publicity, especially among employees, Oregon, Washington, California, Colorado, Kansas and Minnesota require employers to post copies of the orders in conspicuous places on the premises where they may be read by the employees.

Before preceeding to a duscussion of the provision for review of the orders of the commission in the courts, the exceptions made in case of defectives and learners and apprentices should be noted. A very important provision found in all the laws, except in Arkansas, that embody the the commission form of regulation is that relating to exceptions for defectives. Properly administered, such a provision will do much to minimize the objection that the minimum wage will cause the displacement of that class of workers. In California the commission may issue to a woman physically defective by age or otherwise, a special permit to work for a period of six months at a wage fixed by the commission at less than the minimum. Such permits are renewable for like periods of six months. In Colorado a physically defective female, over eighteen years of age, may be granted a permit to work at a special wage fixed by the commission. Massachusetts and Nebraska have provisions similar to the Colorado law but applicable to women of all ages. The Minnesota permit clause is similar to that of Massachusetts with the exception that the whole number of permits issued for a given establishment shall not exceed

one-tenth of the number of workers in that establishment. In Washington and Oregon permits are granted to women physically defective or crippled by age or otherwise. Kansas provides that the commissions may issue special licenses to employees physically defective or crippled or of less than ordinary ability. In Wisconsin the commission is empowered to make rules and regulations whereby any female or minor unable to earn the living wage determined upon shall be granted a special license to work for a wage commensurate with his or her ability.

Except in Colorado, California and Arkansas, the commissions have power to make rates appropriate for learners and apprentices. In Utah the minimum rate is fixed by statute at ninety cents per day, and the period of apprenticeship is limited to one year. In Arkansas a minimum rate of one dollar per day is fixed by statute for those with experience less than six months. In the other states the rates are fixed by the commission. In Oregon and Washington the commissions are empowered to fix apprentice rates and to prescribe a time limit for the period of apprenticeship. In the last named state the power to fix apprentice rates is given "in such class of employment or occupation as usually requires to be learned by apprentices". As stated above, the commission in Wisconsin is given power to fix rates commensurate with the ability of the worker where he or she is unable to earn the regular minimum wage.

The laws of all the states, except Minnesota and Arkansas, make specific provision for appeals from the decisions of the commissions. The grounds upon which appeals may be made, the procedure, the courts to which appeal may be taken, and the matters reviewable by the courts vary in the different states. In California an aggrieved party may file his complaint in the superior court of San Francisco, Sacramento, or Los Angeles Counties within twenty days after the determination of the wage in the given occupation. Twenty days are



allowed the commission to file its answer. The orders of the commission may be set aside only on the grounds that the commission acted without or in excess of its authority, or that the order was secured by fraud. In Colorado the orders of the commission are subject to review by the district court on the ground that the orders are unlawful or unreasonable. The evidence admissible on such appeal is confined to that introduced before the commission at the hearings. In Massachusetts an employer may file a declaration under oath in the supreme judicial court or in the superior court to the effect that compliance with the order of the commission would make it impossible for him to conduct his business at a reasonable profit. Such a declaration secures a review of the order of the commission under the rules of equity procedure. If the averments are proved the court may restrain the commission from publishing the name of the complainant as one of the violators of the order. Such review, however, concerns only the parties filing the declaration and the decree of the court affects no employer not a party to the action.

To secure an appeal in Kansas the action must be commenced within thirty days after the order is made. The district court in which the complainant resides or has his principal place of business, or the district court of Shawnee County has jurisdiction. The order may be set aside on the ground that it is unauthorized by law, is confiscatory, or unreasonable, but the findings of the commission as to facts are conclusive. In Nebraska a review of the proceedings is secured by filing a complaint under oath in the district court alleging that compliance with the order of the commission would endanger the prosperity of the business. The filing of the declaration automatically acts as a stay of execution of the order. If the averments are proved, an order issues revoking the determination of the commission. In Washington and Oregon an appeal may be taken on questions of law only, to the superior court in the former and to the circuit court in the latter state. In



Wisconsin an appeal may be taken, on questions of law only, to the superior court of Dane County and the rulings set aside on the ground that the commission exceeded its authority or that the order was obtained by fraud.

As stated in the first paragraph of this chapter there are two types of laws in respect to the enforcement of the orders of the commissions. In Massachusetts and Nebraska the orders of the commission, together with the names of those employers who refuse to obey them, are published in at least one newspaper in each county of the state. Beyond that, no power is given to enforce the decrees against an unwilling employer. In the other states the orders are mandatory.

One of the important features of the laws in most of the states is that which requires employers to keep registers or records containing the names<sup>of</sup> and other information concerning employees. The experience of the states in enforcing the laws has shown that such records are very important in administration. In Wisconsin, Washington, and Nebraska, employers are required to keep a register of the names and addresses of the women and minors employed. In addition to the names and addresses, California, Massachusetts, and Oregon require a record of the ages of the employees, and in Minnesota the wages paid must also be recorded. Employers in Wisconsin are required to keep a record of the names, addresses, hours and wages, and such other information as the commission may desire. In addition to the names, ages, hours, the records in Arkansas must show the hours of beginning and ending the day's work, and the hours of beginning and ending of the lunch period. In Kansas employers are required to keep a record in such form as the commission may direct. No register is required in Colorado or Utah.

In California, Minnesota, Oregon, Washington, Kansas, and Wisconsin, the commissions are invested with the duty of investigating violations of the law and enforcing their decrees. Actual prosecutions

for violations are carried on through the proper officers of the law in the courts having jurisdiction over the offences. In Utah the duty of enforcement is laid upon the commissioner of immigration, labor and statistics. No such power is given the commission in Colorado. Jurisdiction over offences arising under the act in that state is given to justices of the peace. It should be noted that in California and Washington no authority is given the commission to enforce rulings in regard to hours and conditions of labor, the enforcement of any such rulings falling within the province of the state commissioner of labor.

Appropriate penalties for violations of the law are provided in the several states where the laws are mandatory. These penalties are as follows:-California, a fine of not less than fifty dollars, imprisonment for not less than thirty days, or both (these penalties are for violations of the minimum wage decrees only) ; Colorado, a maximum fine of one hundred dollars, imprisonment not to exceed three months, or both; Kansas and Arkansas, a fine of not less than twenty-five dollars nor more than one hundred dollars, applying to both employers and employees, and in the latter state each day of non-compliance constitutes a separate offence; Minnesota, a fine of not less than ten dollars nor more than fifty dollars, or by imprisonment for not less than ten nor more than sixty days; Oregon, a fine of not less than twenty-five dollars nor more than one hundred dollars, or imprisonment for not less than ten days nor more than three months, or both; Utah, punishable as a misdemeanor under the penal code, i.e., a fine not to exceed three hundred dollars, imprisonment in the county jail not to exceed six months, or both; Washington, a fine of not less than twenty-five nor more than one hundred dollars; Wisconsin, a fine of not less than ten nor more than one hundred dollars.

In addition to the penalties for violations of the orders of the commissions, the laws of all the states except Utah and Arkansas

prescribe penalties for discrimination on the part of employers against any employee because such employee has testified, or is about to testify, or because such employer believes that the employee may testify in any investigation or proceedings relative to the enforcement of the act. Such discrimination constitutes a misdemeanor and is punishable by a fine, varying in the different states from ten to one thousand dollars. No state, however, other than Massachusetts, has a maximum fine higher than one hundred dollars. In Minnesota such offences are punishable by imprisonment for a period of not less than ten nor more than sixty days in addition to a fine in the discretion of the court.

To protect further the employee against the employer who violates the law by paying less than the minimum fixed by the commission it is provided in the laws of six of the states that the employee who has been thus underpaid may recover, in a civil suit, the balance due her. In Oregon and California the plaintiff in such actions is entitled to costs, and in Colorado, Kansas, Minnesota, and Washington, he may recover not only his costs but also attorneys' fees. In all cases, an agreement on the part of the employee to work for less than the legal minimum is of no effect.

## CHAPTER III.

## ORDERS ISSUED BY SOME OF THE COMMISSIONS.

One of the objections raised to the establishment of minimum wage laws is that such laws will not prove practicable. With reference to this it must be said that the experience of states having such laws is too limited to furnish sufficient evidence upon which to base final conclusions as to their success. Enough has been done, however, to give some idea of the effectiveness of the commissions in some of the states in conducting investigations, organizing wage boards, holding conferences, and formulating decrees. Much of the success or failure of the laws will depend on the care and wisdom displayed by the commissions and wage boards in gathering the facts and formulating proper orders based thereon. This is especially true where the wages in industries dealt with are considerably lower than the living wage defined in the statute.

In some of the states little has been done, but in others orders have been issued dealing with important industries employing thousands of women. The work thus far done has been along two different lines. In the one case, as in Massachusetts, the wage boards have been appointed for a particular industry. In other states, such as Oregon, Washington, and Minnesota, one entire class of industries, such as mercantile establishments or factories, has been taken as a whole. In this chapter an effort is made to present a review of some of the investigations and hearings of the wage board and commissions, and of the scope and nature of the orders issued. In so far as it is possible with the meager statistics available, the effects of the orders on wages will be shown and the defects and strong features of the laws, as shown by the short experience of the commissions, will be considered. The review will include Oregon, Washington, Massachusetts, Minnesota, and Utah.

Oregon.

Though Oregon was not the first state to pass a minimum wage law, the commission in that state was the first to issue an order fixing a minimum wage. That order, known as order No.1, was issued August 5, 1913, and went into effect October 4th. of the same year. No conference preceded this order since the commission has power to make rulings as to minors without conference recommendations. The order applied to girls under the age of eighteen employed in any manufacturing or mercantile establishment, millinery, dressmaking or hair dressing shop, laundry, hotel or restaurant, telephone or télégraph establishment or office in the state. It fixed fifty hours per week and eight and one-third hours per day as a maximum, and prohibited the employment of such girls after the hour of six o'clock P. M. A minimum wage of one dollar a day for girls between the ages of sixteen and eighteen years was prescribed.

Before the above order was issued a conference on factories in Portland had been called<sup>and</sup> <sub>A</sub> was carrying on its investigations. The personnel of the conference was as follows: three representatives of the employers, three representatives of the public, one of whom was a woman, and three representatives of employees. The same plan was followed in the other conferences that have been called. In the mercantile conference, however, there were two women and one man representing the public.

A public hearing on the recommendations of this conference was held early in September and the second order of the commission was issued to take effect November 10, 1913. This order forbade the employment of any woman in any manufacturing establishment in Portland for more than fifty-four hours per week or nine hours per day, fixed a minimum lunch period of not less than forty-five minutes, and established a minimum wage for experienced adult women, working at time rates, at \$8.64 per week. It



was from this order that an appeal was taken. The case was carried to the supreme court, where the law was upheld as constitutional, and later to the United States Supreme Court.<sup>1</sup>

The conference on mercantile establishments in Portland began its hearings one day earlier than the conference on factories. Hearings were held by the commission on the recommendations of this conference, and an order issued to take effect November 23, 1913. This order, known as Order No. 3, applied to workers in Portland only. It prohibited the employment of women in mercantile establishments for more than eight and one-third hours per day, or fifty hours per week, or after the hour of six o'clock P. M. , and fixed a minimum wage of \$9.25 per week for experienced adult women workers.

Prior to the issuance of the last two orders named, the commission had called a conference to investigate and report on wages and hours of women employed in offices in the city of Portland. The recommendations of the conference were accepted and hearings held early in December, and a fourth order issued which became effective February 2, 1914. This order prohibited the employment of an adult woman in any office in Portland for more than fifty-one hours per week or at less than forty dollars a month. The following classes were included in this ruling: stenographers, bookkeepers, typists, billing clerks, filing clerks, cashiers (including those in moving picture theatres, restaurants, amusement parks, ice cream stands, etc.), checkers, invoicers, comptometer operators, auditors, and all kinds of clerical work.

In order to apply the law to industries outside of Portland and to those industries in Portland not covered by the preceding orders, until such time as special conferences for each class of industry could be called,

1. Stettler v. O'Hara, et. al, , 139 Pacific 743.



the commission organized a "state-wide" conference. The conference was instructed that its recommendations would be preliminary to the formation of special conferences later. After conducting its investigations and holding its hearings, the conference submitted its recommendations which were adopted by the commission, and after hearings were held thereon, the fifth order was issued. This order went into effect February 7, 1914. It prohibited the employment of any woman in any industry in the state for more than fifty-four hours per week, fixed a weekly wage of at least \$8.25 for experienced, and \$6 for inexperienced adult workers employed at time rates, and limited the employment of women in mercantile, manufacturing, or laundry establishments to not later than eight-thirty o'clock P.M. of any day.

Up to the present time the Commission has issued ten permits to slow, infirm, small, or crippled workers. The following table shows the industries in which licensees were employed, the location of the industries, the number of permits issued, and the reasons therefor.

<u>Industry</u>	<u>Location</u>	<u>No.</u>	<u>Reason for issuing.</u>
1. Paper box factory --	Portland	- 1 --	Aged and slow.
2. Mercantile store ---	"	- 2 --	One, slowness; one, deafness
3. Fruit cannery -----	"	- 1 --	Aged, slow, and infirm.
4. Rug factory -----	"	- 1 --	Slow from illness, past middle age.
5. Laundry -----	"	- 2 --	One, crippled hand; one, slow.
6. Laundry -----	Eugene	- 1 --	Aged and slow.
7. ** -----		- 2 --	Too small in stature.

Though statistics showing the effects of the orders on wages in the different industries are not available, some idea of the effect of the orders on wages may be gained from a study of the earnings of laundry workers in Portland after the orders went effect as shown by a recent report.<sup>1</sup> The order fixing a minimum in this occupation went into effect February 7, 1914, and the figures given in the report show earnings for the week ending April 25 of the same year. In the following table

---

1. Oregon; Industrial Welfare Commission, Rept., "Power Laundries in Portland".

are shown the percentages of workers earning less than the specified sums during the above mentioned week, and, also, for the purpose of comparison, the earnings of 140 women employed in the same industry as reported by the Consumers' League prior to the passage of the minimum wage law.

Report of	No. of Emp.	Per Cent Earning Less than Specified Sums				
		Under \$7	Under \$8	Under \$9	Under \$10	Over \$10
Consumers' League	140	20.6	47.7	76.9	92.6	7.4
Commission	712	7.8	29.3	54.6	67.7	32.3

In comparing the two, allowance must be made for the facts that the investigations were made at different times and by different agents, and that a smaller number of workers were included in the first. The wide difference, however, suggests that the fixing of a minimum wage had an influence in raising the earnings in the industry.

One of the interesting features of the orders issued by the Oregon commission is that of confining them to certain localities in some occupations. Thus for example, several of the orders apply to Portland only. This should prove to be a very valuable precedent for the commissions in other states.

On the whole the public has accepted the minimum wage law as a benefit. The press in general is favorable. Employers have accepted the orders of the commission without serious objection and have endeavored to cooperate in the administration of the law. The legal attack on the law is not representative of the attitude of employers. Prices have not been raised generally. In some instances laundry prices, however, were raised on account of the increase in wage rates.

Washington

During the year 1914 seven industrial conferences were held in the State of Washington, and the recommendations of six of them embodied in orders.<sup>1</sup> Since lack of time prevented the establishment of minima in all industries in the state, the effort was made to apply the law to the most important and general occupations. The conferences were made up as follows: three disinterested persons representing the public, usually two men and one woman, but in the telephone and telegraph conference and in the office help conference there were two women and one man; three employers, and three employees. Forty-one of the sixty-three representatives on the seven boards were from Seattle, Tacoma, and Spokane. The other twenty-two came from fourteen different cities and towns.

The first conference was that called in the mercantile trade early in April, 1914. In the latter part of the same month, after receiving the recommendations unanimously agreed upon by the conference, the commission issued an order to become effective June 27. This order fixed the minimum wage for women over the age of eighteen at \$10 per week. It further provided that not less than one hour per day be allowed females for lunch, and imposed the duty of observing certain sanitary requirements with regard to ventilation, heating, and rest rooms. For persons under the age of eighteen the minimum was fixed at \$6 per week, and the employment of such persons, after the hour of seven-thirty P.M. was forbidden.

The second industry taken up by the commission was that of manufacturing, in which a conference was held in May. The recommendations of the conference were accepted and issued as orders of the commission in June, effective August 1. A minimum wage of \$8.90 for women eighteen years of age and over, and of \$6 for persons under that age was established. The requirements as to sanitary conditions and

1. The recommendations of one of the conferences was rejected; cf. the following page.

the seven-thirty closing hour were the same as in the first order.

The first conference<sup>1</sup> on laundries and dye works was held immediately after the one on manufacturing. This conference recommended a minimum wage of \$8.50 which was immediately rejected by the commission on the ground that such sum did not enable a woman to maintain herself in health and comfort. A second conference for the same industries was called which met in June. Its recommendations were accepted by the commission except the one giving employees power, by a two-thirds vote, to shorten the lunch period from one hour to not less than thirty minutes. It was held by the attorney general that such power could not be delegated to the employees. The other recommendations were embodied in orders issued June 25, effective in sixty days. The order fixed the minimum wage for women eighteen years of age and over at \$9 per week, and for persons under that age at \$6 per week. The provisions as to sanitary requirements were similar to those in the preceding orders. The employment of any girl under the age of eighteen as "shaker", a very heavy line of work requiring no skill or special training, was absolutely forbidden.

Within a week after the hearings held by the conference in the laundry and dye industries, the fourth conference, that on telegraph and telephone occupations, began its hearings. Its recommendations were accepted and promulgated as orders July 9, to become effective, as usual, in sixty days. These orders fixed a minimum wage of \$9 for women over eighteen years of age, established a minimum of one hour for lunch for females, and prescribed sanitary requirements as to ventilation and rest rooms. On August 7 the commission issued orders fixing the minimum wage for minors at \$6 per week, except for such messengers with

---

1. A Seattle employer discharged a girl for serving on this board. He refused to reinstate her. Upon prosecution he was fined \$100 and costs.

in third class cities and towns as are employed continuously and are paid by piece rate. In addition the orders prohibited the employment of minors of either sex in any telephone, telegraph, or mercantile establishment, or any messenger or parcel delivery service before the hour of six in the morning or after nine o'clock in the evening.

The fifth occupation for which orders were issued was that of general office work including stenographers, bookkeepers, typists, billing clerks, filing clerks, cashiers, checkers, invoicers, comptometer operators, and any clerical office work of whatsoever kind. This conference was held early in December 1914. Its recommendations were adopted by the commission December 21, and orders issued the same day to become effective February 20 of the present year. By these orders, the minimum wage for women eighteen years of age and over was fixed at \$10 per week; for persons of either sex between the ages of sixteen and eighteen, \$7.50 per week; for those under sixteen years of age, \$6 per week. The lunch period for females was fixed at not less than one hour.

In regard to rates for apprentices the commission has adopted some very definite rules and policies, varying, of course, with the different industries. In the mercantile occupations the limit of the period of apprenticeship is one year with a minimum wage of \$6 for the first six months, and \$7.50 for the second six months. No license is valid where more than seventeen per cent of the total number of adult female employees are apprentices nor where more than fifty per cent of such apprentices are receiving less than \$7.50 per week. In the millinery and dress making establishments the one year period of apprenticeship is divided into three wage periods; seventeen weeks with a minimum of \$3 per week; seventeen weeks with a minimum of \$5 per week; and eighteen weeks with a minimum of \$7.50 per week.



The period of apprenticeship in telephone and telegraph establishments was fixed at nine months and divided into periods as follows; three months at a minimum wage of \$6, two months at \$6.60, two months at a minimum of \$7.20, and a minimum of \$7.80 for the last two months. In the smaller exchanges, however, there are but two periods, \$6 per week as a minimum for the first four months, and \$7.50 for the last five months. In laundries the period of apprenticeship was limited to six months with a minimum wage of \$6 for the first three months, and \$7.50 for the last three months. The number of apprentices is limited to twenty-five per cent of the total number of females employed. Owing to the diversity of conditions in factories, the maximum allowed varies from six weeks to one year with a minimum wage ranging from \$6 to the legal minimum for the trade. In office work the period is limited to six months, and the minimum wage is fixed at \$ 7.50 per week.

The effect of the orders on the wages of employees is shown by the results of some investigations made by the commission since the orders went into effect. For example, 55.1 per cent of the 3,189 females and minors employed in 24 mercantile establishments in September, 1913, were earning less than \$10 per week. In the same establishments one year later, about three months after the orders in that occupation went into effect, out of 3,102 women and minors, 18.1 per cent were earning less than the above sum. Taking the same months for comparison in the laundry trade, the statistics show that 43 per cent of the 665 employees in eleven laundries in 1913, received less than \$9 per week. In the same establishments in 1914, 30 per cent of the 635 employees received less than that sum. Of the 1,040 telephone operators employed in September 1913, 58 per cent received less than \$9 per week. A year later, 32.9 per cent of the 1,091 employed in the same exchanges received less than that sum per week. The investigations showed that there was no tendency to scale down those who had received wages higher than the minimum wage established by the commission.



Speaking before the American Economic Association at its annual meeting, December 1914, Dr. Theresa S. McMahan of Seattle, who until January 1, 1914, was a member of the Washington Commission, maintained that the commission in that state had committed two errors what would destroy the effectiveness of the law if allowed to continue. In the first place the period of one year for apprenticeship in mercantile trades is too long, giving employers an opportunity and a motive for hiring inexperienced employees and displacing the experienced workers. Secondly, the difference between the minimum wage for adults and for minors four dollars, is too great. Here again a premium was put upon youth and child labor. "Industrial history suggests that if rulings continue to be made along lines established by the pioneer states in the movement, minimum wage legislation will fail in its purpose".

Concerning the general effect of the law the commission states, "seldom, too, has any law, in actuality, been so well received, its application been accomplished with so little opposition, and, for a law of this character, been attended with so little industrial disturbance, as that same minimum wage law. None of the dire predictions made prior to the passage of the law have come about to an extent that questions the general efficiency of the law. There has been no wholesale discharge of women employees, no wholesale leveling of wages, no wholesale replacing of higher paid workers by cheaper help, no tendency to make the minimum the maximum, while the employers of the state in general have been following the letter and spirit of the law and aiding greatly in its application".<sup>2</sup> "The wave of disapproval which swept the ranks of women workers when the commission's wage orders were first becoming effective---

1. Reported in American Economic Review; (Supplement) March 1915, pp 291-5.

2. Washington; Indus. Wel. Comm., 1st. Biennial Rept., January 1915, p. 13.

disapproval born of fear that they would lose their employment--has since been dissipated as the women workers have seen none of the evils predicted accomplished".<sup>1</sup>

Concerning the displacement of adult workers by apprentices and minors, the commission expresses its opinion thus: "That the number of women replaced by apprentices or minors or some other workers is so small as to be an absolutely negligible factor in the situation, can be realized when it is stated that the total number of minors and apprentices combined, in mercantile establishments, only equals the percentage established by the commission for the number of apprentices alone that would be permitted--seventeen per cent--from which fact it can be quickly seen why the commission is not greatly concerned over this feature of the establishment of the minimum wage law".<sup>2</sup>

In regard to the increase in wages the commission has this to say: "The sequence of it all is that there are vastly more women workers in the state of Washington today receiving a living wage than there were two years ago when the wage law was enacted; that there are more higher paid girls now than there were then; that the whole wage standard together with the standard of efficiency and discipline has been raised; that industry itself has been taught the lesson that higher paid workers are better workers".<sup>3</sup>

In investigating the effect on industry the commission found that where the industry in question could pass on the increase in the shape of higher prices it did so. Others not so situated are having some difficulty in adjusting themselves to the new conditions. This is particularly true of the candy factories, cracker factories, box factories and garment factories whose products come into competition with "the products of the sweat shops of the East".

---

1. Washington; Indus. Welf. Comm., 1st Biennial Rept., January 1915, p. 17.

2. Ibid., p. 17.

3. Ibid., p. 13.

Among the other results found by the commission were a better adjustment with employees, prevention of exploitation and sweating, diminution of the parasitic character of some of the industries, prevention of undercutting by unscrupulous employers, causing employers to give more attention to training the incompetent<sup>so</sup>, as to be able to earn a living wage, and increase in the efficiency of the workers.

In its recommendations to the legislature in its first biennial report the commission states:"-the only recommendation the Commission has to make to the legislature is to advise against any modification of the law until it has been given further trial. The Commission does not feel that the law has been in operation long enough to justify it in making recommendations as to advisable changes in it".<sup>1</sup>

### Minnesota.

More than fourteen months elapsed between the time the commission in Minnesota was organized and the time it issued its first orders. In the meantime, investigations were carried on by advisory boards in the Twin Cities and Duluth, and by the secretary of the commission in other cities. Two boards were appointed early in 1914 by the commission for the cities named, one for the mercantile trade and the other for manufactures. The two boards combined in Duluth and formed one board. Considerable difficulty was experienced in getting employees to serve on the board, especially in the Twin Cities. Of the ten representatives of employees on the mercantile board only two were working girls in the ordinary sense, two were welfare workers employed in stores, and six were club women.<sup>2</sup> Of the two employees only one attended the final meeting and one voted against an adequate minimum wage. Only one employee was found who would serve on the manufacturing

---

1. Washington; Indust. Welfare Comm., 1st. Biennial Report. p 84.

2. Ryan, John A. "The Task of Minimum Wage Boards in Minnesota" Survey 33:171-172. Cf. also Rept. of Minimum Wage Commission 1915, pp. 3-4.

board, and she did not attend the final meeting, though urged to do so. In Duluth, where the two boards were combined, there were eight employees on the board. They attended a majority of the meetings and four voted on the final recommendations. The unwillingness on the part of employees to serve on the boards was due to timidity, diffidence, lack of energy<sup>1</sup> and interest, and the fear of incurring the displeasure of employers.

More difficulty was experienced by the boards in determining the cost of board and lodging than the cost of clothes and incidentals. The employers contended that since the girls adrift constituted a small minority of the workers the cost of living should be based on the cost to those living at home, and that other means should be devised for helping the adrift worker; that it was unwise to raise the wages of the whole number, entailing hardship on the industry and employer, in order to benefit the few.<sup>1</sup>

The recommendations of the Duluth board and the manufacturing board in the Twin Cities were made in July. The vote on the Duluth report was sixteen to two, the employers present concurring in the recommendation. The manufacturing board in the Twin Cities adopted its recommendations by a vote of nine to four, the employers voting in opposition. In the mercantile board the vote on the final report stood eleven to nine. There being twenty-five members of the board, the eleven votes did not constitute a majority as required by law to constitute a valid recommendation.

Hearings on the recommendations were held in September following. On October 15, the commission met to determine the minimum rates based on the preceding investigations and reports. The member of the commission representing employers refused to participate in the deliberations, and later resigned from the commission. Eight days later the two remaining members of the commission met and issued six orders affecting

---

1. Ryan, John A. "The Task of Minimum Wage Boards in Minnesota" Survey 33:171-172. Cf. also Rept. of the Minimum Wage Commission 1915, pp.3-4.

occupations over the state.

The first order fixed a minimum wage of \$9 per week for women and minors of ordinary ability, excluding learners and apprentices, in any mercantile office, waitress or hair dressing occupation in cities of the first class. The second order fixed the minimum wage in the same occupations in cities of the second, third and fourth class at \$8.50 per week. The third order fixed the minimum for all other cities at \$8 per week.

Orders No. 4, 5, and 6 dealt with employees, exclusive of learners and apprentices, in the following occupations: manufacturing, mechanical, telephone, telegraph, laundry, dyeing, dry cleaning, lunch room, and hotel. For cities of the first class the minimum wage was fixed at \$8.75 per week; for cities of the second, third, and fourth class at \$8.25 per week; and for other cities at \$8 per week. All of the orders were to become effective in thirty days. Before that time elapsed, however, two bills were filed in the district court of Ramsey County invoking its equity power to restrain the commission from enforcing the orders on the ground that the law was unconstitutional. On November 23 the court granted a temporary injunction restraining the commission from performing any official act under the provisions of the law and from enforcing or attempting to enforce the orders promulgated. The case was appealed but until such time as the supreme court shall dissolve the injunction no further steps can be taken.

#### Massachusetts.

The first industry in Massachusetts for which a wage board was organized was the brush industry. The industry is a small one, employing less than two thousand persons, most of whom are women. The tables given in Chapter 1 show the rate of wages prevailing in the industry. The investigation convinced the commission that the wages paid a substantial



number of the employees were inadequate to supply the necessary cost of living, and to maintain the workers in health. As a result, a wage board was created.

In calling for a wage board it was the policy of the commission to make it as widely representative as possible. With that end in view every manufacturer of brushes in the state was asked to make nominations of persons to represent the employers. An effort was made to get representatives from the employees in such a way as to represent the different nationalities and groups. The employers finally chosen showed a readiness to accept. The employees were less willing to accept places on the board owing to a fear that they might lose their positions in the factories. In only one instance, however, was this fear well founded. In that case two members were discharged immediately after they accepted places on the board. As finally organized, the board consisted of six employers, six employees, and three representatives of the public. One of the last named group was designated as chairman by the commission.

The board held its first meeting December 12, 1913, and began its deliberations under rules laid down by the commission. Its deliberations were marked by considerable disagreement. After a long struggle the highest wage the employers would offer was fourteen cents per hour. Later, all but one of them agreed to fifteen and one-half cents per hour but the rest of the board would agree to that figure only if coupled with a recommendation of an advance to eighteen cents at the end of the year, in case no evidence should arise before that time to justify a revision of the latter figure. "Thus after being in session more than six months, the Wage Board stood divided in its final recommendations, the employers on one side, and the representatives of the employees



and of the public on the other."<sup>1</sup>

A preliminary report was made March 17, 1914, containing a study of conditions in the industry, and the principles by which the board was guided in making its determinations.<sup>2</sup> The final report was submitted to the commission June 12, six months after the board was organized. The report was accepted and notice given of a public hearing to be held June 29. Following the hearing, an order was issued to become effective August 15 decreeing:- a minimum time wage for experienced female employees, of fifteen and one-half cents per hour; a rate for learners at sixty-five per cent of the above minimum, and a time limit on the period of apprenticeship of one year; and where a piece rate yielded less than the minimum time rate, such persons to be paid not less than the above time rate per hour. The findings applied to minors also. Though rejecting the recommendation of an automatic rate of eighteen cents per hour at the end of one year, the commission indicated that it would look with approval on such recommendation at the end of that time. The wage boards in that state are a continuous body so that the board may be convened at any time. The members of the board in this case were appointed for a period of three years.

Though no statistics are available to show the effect of the decree on the wages in the industry, it was stated by the secretary of the wage board that a recent inspection of the pay rolls of the factories shows that the order is being observed by employers, though the only power of punishing a disobedient employer is by publication of his

- 
1. Evans, Mrs. Elizabeth Glendower, in an address before the American Economic Association, December 1914. Cf. American Economic Review (Supplement), March 1915, pp. 270-277.
  2. Massachusetts; Minimum Wage Commission, Bulletin No. 1, p. 10.

name in the papers. Only sixteen persons were found who were receiving less than the minimum rates prescribed by the commission. Actual earnings, however, will still be low. Even at an average of fifty hours per week, "a most improbable assumption", the wage per week would be but \$7.75, which is one dollar below "the minimum required for living expenses". The commission sought to secure what could be accomplished rather than what it might abstractly desire.<sup>1</sup>

Some idea of the defects revealed by the short experience of the of the commission with the law may be gathered from the recommendations contained in its report to the legislature of 1914. It was urged that the requirement of at least six representatives of employers and a like number of employees be repealed and the number left to the discretion of the commission. The commission believes that a much smaller number than that required by the statute is adequate in smaller industries and in those in which it is difficult to get the representatives together. As a matter of economy it was recommended that the provision requiring publication in at least one newspaper in each county of the state be repealed and the matter left largely to the discretion of the commission. A third recommendation called for a provision requiring employers to keep a record of the wages paid per week to each of the employees, in addition to the names, occupations, and addresses as required by the law. This was urged on the ground that adequate records are essential to execution of the law. Lastly it was recommended that the law be strengthened in regard to punishment for discrimination against an employee who in any way assisted in the administration of the law. It was found that every possible means should be used to rid employees of any fear or apprehension of discrimination.

---

1. Evans, Mrs. Elizabeth Glendower, in address cited above.

Utah.<sup>1</sup>

As stated elsewhere, the Utah law provides for the payment of a minimum wage of seventy-five cents to females under eighteen years of age, and ninety cents to adult learners and apprentices, and one dollar and twenty-five cents per day to adults. The law went into effect May 13, 1913. From that date until January 20, 1914, the commissioner of Immigration, Labor, and Statistics investigated some two hundred alleged violations of the law. Where violations were found the employer was given the opportunity to make good to the employee the loss in wages. During the first year of the operation of the law over eight thousand dollars were thus collected and turned over to employees who had been underpaid. Seven prosecutions were brought.

A month before the law went into effect copies of it were mailed to employers of women, in so far as they were known, with the statement that the law would be vigorously enforced. A number of employers voluntarily established a new wage schedule to conform to the requirements of the law and put it into operation on the first day of May. In a number of cases employers served notice on those receiving advances that their retention on the pay roll depended on their increasing their efficiency during a probationary period of from two to four weeks.

About six per cent of the female employees were under the age of eighteen years and approximately ten per cent were adult learners and apprentices, making a total of about sixteen per cent coming under the special classes in the law. Most of the minors were cash girls in the department stores, receiving about four dollars per week. The law had the effect of raising the wages of these to a minimum of \$4.50.

---

1. The facts regarding the Utah law and its effects are taken from a paper read by the Commissioner of Immigration, Labor, and Statistics, before the National Convention of Government Labor Officials of the U. S. and Canada, Nashville, Tenn., June 9, 1914. It will be noted that much of the statistics is estimates and not the result of investigations.

A number of the department stores supplanted cash girls with cash boys. This was easily done since the law applies to females only. Many of the millinery stores discharged the inefficient girl apprentices. Apprentices in this trade must now be paid not less than \$4.50, or work for nothing, in which case the relation of employer and employee does not exist and the law does not apply. In the knitting, candy, paper box, and overall factories, and wollen mills where the piece system obtains, a few girls were discharged who could not earn the minimum wage in their respective classes. These did not exceed three per cent of the whole number of females working in those trades. In general, it is estimated that not over five per cent of the whole number of women workers were discharged and of this number many found employment in other establishments.

The law caused an increase in the wages of about ten per cent of the whole number of women and girls employed. In no establishment in the state was it found that the wage bill increased over five per cent. On the average, the increase was between two and three per cent. In laundries girls were formerly paid from \$6 to \$7 per week. The minimum under the law is \$7.50. The daily wage of chamber maids in rooming houses and European hotels was formerly \$1 per day. Under the law the minimum is now \$1.25 per day.

One of the tendencies of the law is to equalize the wages of the inexperienced and the near-experienced. In response to requests for a ruling the commissioner of immigration, labor and statistics held that any girl or woman who had worked in any kind of store as sales-girl or saleswoman for the period of one year or more, or who had worked as an apprentice in a millinery establishment or as a laundry girl, telephone girl, or in a factory or mill for a like period,

would be considered as "experienced" in her respective line of work. Some employers complain that this ruling causes trouble on account of the fact that many of the employees from small towns and five and ten cent stores are thus held to be experienced and entitled to the minimum of \$1.25 per day though less efficient than the inexperienced workers or minors trained in the city stores. This is a source of considerable discontent among the latter, also.

It is the consensus of opinion among employers that the law increases the efficiency of the workers materially.

CHAPTER IV.CONCLUSIONS.

Any conclusions that may be drawn from the facts set forth in the preceding chapters, especially in regard to the success of the laws or the results attained from their operation, must necessarily be tentative. The period of the application of the laws to conditions in the different states has been too short to offer an adequate basis for final conclusions. The real test of the laws will come in the future. It is fortunate that the statutes of the states give an opportunity to study not only the different kinds of laws in actual operation, but also the same kind of laws under different conditions. The states having laws are located in different parts of the country so that in the future each will have the experience of a state similarly located, upon which to base any action that it may choose to take in the regulation of the wages of women. In the New England Group is Massachusetts; in the north central part of the country, Minnesota and Wisconsin; in the central agricultural region are Kansas and Nebraska; in the south central portion is Arkansas; in the mountain states, Utah and Colorado; and the three coast states on the Pacific.

Territorially then, the minimum wage laws are being given a complete trial. The same is true of differences in industry and conditions. Almost every industry in which women are employed, both in large cities and in rural districts, is brought within the application of a minimum wage law. Unless disturbed by constitutional prohibitions, the success or failure of minimum wage legislation for women and minors



will pass from the realm of speculation to that of fact within the next decade. Whatever the verdict, it will be applicable to almost any state and condition.

Though the final answer as to the success of minimum wage laws for women and minors lies in the future, there is some evidence at hand bearing on the mooted points raised by the opponents and the proponents of such legislation. It must be remembered that the orders issued by the commissions have gone into effect at a time of industrial depression, when the wise and natural policy of employers was one of retrenchment. At such a time a slight strain on the financial condition of the business might cause serious inconvenience. In most cases the commissions have shown due recognition of the existence of such depression in the orders issued. In other words, there has been due regard for the probable effect of the orders on business and a desire to introduce the laws with as little disturbance as possible. That no greater disturbance has been caused in the inauguration of the application of the laws reflects considerable credit on the work of the commissions. This in itself is an auspicious circumstance pointing to the success of the laws.

Numerous effects were looked for by those interested in the enactment of the laws in this country. These expectations have been based on deductive reasoning and from observations derived from the experience of Australia and England where the minimum wage has been in existence for some time. One of the results expected to flow from the enforcement of the laws in this country was the stimulation of the organization of women workers. In so far as revealed by the reports of the commissions that movement has not yet developed. It is too early for such a result to become apparent since the first order

issued in the United States has been in effect but twenty months and most of the orders for a considerably shorter time.

One of the effects observed by the commissions and those familiar with conditions in the localities where the laws are effective and which was predicted as a matter of course prior to the enactment of the laws, is that the establishment of a minimum wage tends to fix standards in hitherto unstandardized occupations. The lack of standards and the lack of self-protection on the part of female employees has resulted in each employer being something of a law unto himself in the matter of wages and conditions of employment. As a result, in each case where investigations were made, such, for example, as those summarized in the first chapter in connection with the causes of low earnings, it was found that employers who chose to do so found opportunity to exploit labor as a part of the profits of the business. The tendency revealed thus far is that the minimum wage will place a level in the competitive labor market for women, below which wages cannot go. Once such laws have become established and adapted to conditions, and a proper living wage fixed as a minimum, the opportunity for exploitation below such minimum will have disappeared. This tendency is quite evident in the experience gained thus far. The investigations have shown, too, that the more progressive employers recognize the advantage of the movement in this respect; that it will make the efficiency and ability of competitors exert itself upward in the form of better business management and organization rather than in the beating down of wages and exploitation of labor.

An objection raised by employers and shared in many instances by employees and others is that the laws will result in a material reduction in the wages of the higher paid employees. The more ardent

opponents have gone so far as to assert that the minimum will become the maximum as well. For the same reason, employees have in some instances been unwilling to grant interviews or answer questions or in any way facilitate the investigations or application of laws. Without indulging in speculation as to the probable future course of events, it is enough to say that while there will probably be some tendency to reduce the earnings of the higher paid employees, the experience of the states as reported thus far has not been such as to justify the pessimistic predictions made by the more radical opponents. The investigation of mercantile, laundry, and telephone industries by the commission in Washington one year after the orders went into effect, as compared with an investigation of the same plants prior to the application of the law gives no evidence of a scaling down of wages of those above the minimum in an effort to recoup the losses sustained by the rise in wages below the minimum. The commission voiced its conclusion thus, "-- there has been no tendency, as was feared by even some of the supporters of the minimum wage law, to level down the wage of the better paid girls to equalize the increase made in the wages of the lower paid; that there has been no tendency for the minimum wage to become the maximum wage, but that on the contrary, the wages of the better paid girls have actually increased in a degree to correspond to the increase of the lower priced girls." <sup>1</sup>

With reference to the effect of the laws on business, while the ultimate effect is to be determined in the future, there are some facts that have been noted, showing tendencies thus far. One of the arguments against the adoption of the minimum wage in the different

-----

1. Washington; Industrial Welfare Commission, 1st. Biennial Rept., p. 13. 1915.

states was the danger of competition from industries in other states where no such laws are found. Theoretically it would seem that this effect will not be prominent if it be true that the wages of the higher paid employees will be reduced. The effect will depend to a large extent upon the nature of the product, the amount of labor involved in its production, the location of the competing concerns, and other things that might be mentioned, so that any generalizations that might be made would be subject to many qualifications. It was found in Washington that some injury was caused in certain industries coming into competition with eastern industries. Where differences in cost could be made to pass on in the shape of higher prices to the consumers in industries not competing with eastern concerns, no difficulty was experienced. The cracker and candy factories, the garment and box-making establishments were those which were found to suffer the most inconvenience under the operation of the law. It is conceivable also that in some industries in which there is no danger of competition, the increase in wages will cause hardship to an industry, but thus far no case has been found where an industry was compelled to suspend as a result of the operation of the law. As mentioned in the preceding chapter, one department in one of the brush factories in Massachusetts employing sixteen women was closed down, but such action has not been definitely traced to the operation of the minimum wage in that industry.

It must not be forgotten, too, that there are factors set at work which will tend to offset any loss entailed through higher wages. Such evidence as has been collected seems to show that there is a noticeable increase in efficiency which will tend to offset the loss and even, in some cases, to increase the profits from the business.

Unless the whole theory of the relation of efficiency to earnings is wrong, a higher standard of wages applying to all competing occupations must tend to increase the employers product from his business. This belief is strengthened by the fact that prior to the enactment of any laws, some employers prospered while paying higher rates of wages than competitors working under the same conditions in the same state. The brief experience with minimum wage laws on this point has confirmed the opinions of those who were competent to speak on the probable effect of the law on business. It remains to be seen whether there will continue to be a parallelism between theory and experience.

In some cases the increase in wages has resulted in an increase in prices. This has occurred in some of the laundry establishments in Oregon and in some industries in Washington. In general, however, no increase in prices has followed from the regulation of wages. Where low prices are secured at the cost of underpaid labor, the consumer should justly pay the increase necessary to give the employees the rate of wages required for decent living. In other cases the increase in wages can be had without a rise in prices or decrease in profits, through the increased efficiency of management and of labor.

Considerable speculation has been indulged in as to the displacement of inefficient workers. The right of the inefficient workers to work and the injustice of a law that causes their displacement has been one of the favorite themes of those who object to the minimum wage laws. In no state, however, has there been any wholesale displacement of the inefficient. It has been found that some women have been discharged on this ground but the number is negligible. Some displacement was inevitable, and where the discharged could be classed



among the unemployable they must be cared for in some other way.<sup>1</sup> The evidence shows that in numerous cases the inefficient have become efficient, and that employers are demanding better training during apprenticeship and making more adequate provision for such training. It should be noted, too, that the force of the objection has been considerably diminished by the provisions in the laws providing for exceptions in the case of those who are not capable of earning the minimum wage in their respective occupations.

Quite naturally the administration of the laws has proved a problem demanding care and efficiency. For the most part the various commissions have met the problems involved with a proper sense of the importance of their work in the critical period of the new movement. One of the difficulties which has perplexed the commissions in some of the states is the timidity and indifference of employees. It was found necessary in Massachusetts to recommend more stringent provisions for the protection of employees from intimidation and discrimination on the part of employers. In some cases employees, because of their fears, have been actually antagonistic to the efforts of the commissions and wage boards. In Minnesota there was a striking lack of interest on the part of the women. The experience thus far shows that there is a tendency for this problem to solve itself with the further application of the law and the rigid enforcement of the provisions in the laws imposing penalties upon employers who in any way discriminate against employees assisting in or taking part in the administration of the law. The facts suggest that a large part of the success of the laws will

-----

1. For a discussion of necessary supplementary legislation, see Seager, "The Minimum Wage as Part of a Program for Social Reform", *Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science*, 48:1-12.



depend on the development of a spirit of cooperation on the part of employees, not only with the commission but also among themselves. If the organization of women workers results from the operation of the laws as has been predicted, the work of the commissions, not only in the fixing of rates and conducting investigations, but also in the enforcement of the laws, will be materially facilitated. Other difficulties of enforcing the laws have not developed to such an extent that they can be measured or discussed intelligently. The employers in general in those states reporting on the matter at all have shown a spirit of cooperation. Even in Massachusetts, where the laws are not mandatory, such investigations as have been made show the employers are paying the rates fixed by the commission. Evasions of the law have been noted in some of the states but they are, so far as the commissions have been able to ascertain, the exception. The evasions indicate, however, that a great deal of vigilance on the part of the commission will be necessary to enforce the law on all coming within the scope of the law. Especially will this be true where employees are indifferent or timid about notifying the commissions of violations. As an aid in the enforcement of the laws more adequate records on the part of employers were found necessary in Massachusetts. The same thing will probably be found to be true in some of the other states.

One of the most perplexing problems that have faced the commissions is that of apprentice regulations and rates for learners. As was expected by students of the problem, there have been instances where employers have taken advantage of the lower rates for learners and apprentices and minors and have shown a tendency to adopt the policy of employing these classes in preference to those entitled to the

higher rates prescribed for adults. Though this policy has not become general, it is one that must be met with care by the commissions. The plans pursued thus far have taken the form of restrictions on the length of the period of apprenticeship and the number of apprentices in a given occupation. Wisely used these two checks should prove sufficient safeguard against any general displacement of adult workers and a premium on child labor.

One of the valuable results found to flow from the action of the commissions and wage boards has been the better understanding on the part of both employers and employees arising out of the sessions of the wage boards in their efforts to arrive at minima in the given occupations. This has resulted in the employer getting a better conception of the actual living conditions of his employees and their actual needs in order to maintain a decent standard of living. It is entirely possible that the wage conferences, where the parties have been carefully represented, have had much to do with the apparent willingness on the part of employers to cooperate in putting the new laws into effect. The power of such conferences for future adjustment of the wage problem in connection with the employment of women should be of increasing importance.

One of the interesting questions to be determined by the history of minimum wage legislation in this country is the effectiveness of the different types of laws. Thus far the commission form of law with advisory or wage boards seems to be the most effective. The form of law adopted in Colorado has been deemed so inadequate that no efforts have been made or will be made to issue orders or fix rates of wages. A law modeled somewhat on the lines of the Oregon statute was passed

by the legislature at its last session but was vetoed by the governor. In regard to the Massachusetts type of non-mandatory law, it is difficult to see what object can be gained by denying the power to enforce orders after the machinery has been created to prescribe rates. To date, the law has been fairly successful. Employers have observed the rates ordered in the brush industry. The real test, however, for the law in that state will come in the future. The rates established are admittedly below a decent living wage for full time workers. When larger industries are concerned and when the minimum established is a living wage it will remain to be seen whether the publication of the names of recalcitrant employers will be sufficient to secure the observance of those rates.

The minimum wage movement in this country has a reason for its existence in the problem of low earnings, and thus far it has given evidences as to its possibilities as a solution of the problem. Enough has been done to show the possibilities within it and to demonstrate some of the weaknesses and limitations in the laws that have been passed. Unless annulled by the courts, the minimum wage bids fair to become a part of the permanent legislation of the states dealing with the labor problem. Its short history furnishes ground for encouragement to those who have urged its adoption.

BIBLIOGRAPHY.<sup>1</sup>REPORTS

- California. Industrial Welfare Commission; First Biennial Report. 1915.
- Connecticut. Special Commission to Investigate the Conditions of Wage-Earning Women and Minors; Report. 1913.  
Bureau of Labor; Biennial Report. 1913-1914.
- Illinois. Bureau of Labor Statistics. Report. 1909.
- Kansas. Bureau of Labor. Report. 1913.
- Massachusetts. Bureau of Statistics; Labor Bulletin Number 101. 1914.  
Minimum Wage Commission; First Annual Report. 1914.  
Minimum Wage Commission; Bulletin Number 3. 1914.  
Minimum Wage Commission; Bulletin Number 4. 1914.  
Minimum Wage Commission; Bulletin Number 5. 1914.
- Michigan. Commission of Inquiry; Preliminary Report. 1915.
- Minnesota. Minimum Wage Commission; First Biennial Report. 1915.
- New York. State Factory Investigating Commission. Third Report. 1914.
- Ohio. Industrial Commission. Department of Investigation and Statistics; Report Number 1. 1914.
- Oregon. Consumers' League. Social Survey Committee; Report. January, 1913.  
Industrial Welfare Commission; Report, "Power Laundries in Portland"  
Industrial Welfare Commission; First Biennial Report. 1915.
- Washington. Industrial Welfare Commission; Report, March 1914.  
Industrial Welfare Commission; Report, First Biennial. 1915.
- Kansas City, Missouri. Board of Public Welfare; Fourth Annual Report. 1913.
- New York City. National Civic Federation; Welfare Department; Report.  
National Civic Federation Review, July 15, 1913.

---

1. This bibliography contains those sources of information cited in the text or found particularly valuable for reference. Among others, the bibliography appended to the report of the Ohio Industrial Commission gives a very complete list of references and sources of information.

United States. Bureau of Labor.

- Report; "Condition of Woman and Child Wage-Earners in the United States." Particularly Volumes I, II, and V.
- Bulletin 91; "Working Hours of Wage-Earning Women in Selected Industries in Chicago."
- Bulletin 96; "Working Hours, Earnings, and Duration of Employment of Women Workers in Selected Industries in California."
- Bulletin 116; "Hours, Earnings, and Duration of Employment of Wage-Earning Women in the District of Columbia."
- Bulletin 119; "Working Hours of Women in Wisconsin Pea Canneries."
- Bulletin 122; "Employment of Women in Power Laundries in Milwaukee."
- Bulletin 146; "Wages in Dress and Shirt Waist Industry in New York City."
- Bulletin 160; "Hours, Earnings, and Conditions of Labor of Women in Indiana Mercantile Establishments and Garment Factories."

ARTICLES.

- Abbott, Edith. "Womens Wages in Chicago; Some Notes on Available Data." *Journal of Political Economy*, 1913. 21:143-158.
- Brown, Rome G. "The Minimum Wage". A negative argument in booklet form, dealing particularly with the Minnesota Statute.
- Evans, Mrs. Elizabeth. "Social Aspects of Public Regulation of Wages." *American Economic Review*, March, 1915, pp. 270-277.
- Holcombe, A. N. "The Legal Minimum Wage in the United States". *American Economic Review*, 1912. 2:21-37.
- Kelley, Mrs. Florence. "Minimum Wage Boards." *American Journal of Sociology*, 1911. 17:303-314.
- " " " " "Minimum Wage Laws." *Journal of Political Economy*, 1912. 20:999-1010.
- McMahon, Dr. Theresa S. *American Economic Review*, March, 1915, pp. 291-295.
- Millis, H. A. "Some Aspects of the Minimum Wage." *Journal of Political Economy*, 1914. 22:132-155.
- Phelan, Raymond V. "Minnesota Minimum Wage Law." *American Economic Review*, 1913. 3:989-990.
- Ryan, John A. "The Task of the Minimum Wage Boards in Minnesota". *Survey*, 33:171-172.



Seager, Henry R. "The Minimum Wage as a part of a Program for Social Reform".

Annals of the American Academy, 1913. 48:3-12.

" " "The New Theory of the Minimum Wage".  
American Labor Legislation Review, 1913. 3:81-91.

Webb, Sidney. "The Economic Theory of a Legal Minimum Wage."  
Journal of Political Economy, 1912. 20:973-998.